



Case Information

Reference/Case ID	300018782		
Scheduled Monument	Dumbarton Castle		
Index no	SM90107	Grid ref	NS 39800 74400
Date application validated	06 December 2016		
Summary of proposed works	Governor's House - Raking out cementitious mortar and repoint remaining areas of coursed random rubble on rear elevation		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that approval for raking out cementitious mortar and repointing areas on the rear elevation be **granted**.

2. Background

The monument is a prominent volcanic plug of basalt at the mouth of the River Leven on the north bank of the Firth of Clyde used as a fortification in the early and later medieval periods. Upstanding elements of the medieval castle survive within a Georgian fort and there are important archaeological remains.

The early medieval fort is represented by buried archaeological evidence and two carved stones. It has been associated with a royal centre known as Alduith and described by Bede as a political centre of the Britons. The later medieval castle is represented by several surviving structures, including the Wallace Tower, the Portcullis Arch and the Guard House. Surviving elements of the Georgian fortress include the Governor's House, the French Prison, the Magazine, curtain walls and gun-batteries.

Dumbarton Rock is a Property in Care and has one of the longest recorded histories as a stronghold in Britain. Each phase of use has resulted in nationally important remains and the combination of several phases at an iconic and prominent location can be compared to other centres such as Edinburgh and Stirling.

This application relates to the Governor's House, which formed an important part of the 18th-Century Georgian fort. The application is for the raking out of cementitious mortar,



repairs and repointing areas of the rear (north) elevation. It follows a previous, successfully completed phases of conservation at the Governor's House (Case 201501794). It has been submitted by Historic Environment Scotland Conservation Directorate and has been discussed with Historic Environment Scotland Heritage Directorate in advance.

The application is accompanied by a drawing showing proposed areas of repair.

3. Proposals

The proposals comprise:

- Raking out cementitious mortar on the Governor's House rear (north) elevation.
- Repointing with lime mortar.
- Indenting decayed sandstone rubble where required.
- Repairing timber at windows where required.

Areas of masonry comprising buff sandstone and grey whinstone pointed with cementitious mortar (not original) are decayed in places. It is proposed to rake out areas of decayed cementitious mortar and replace it with new lime mortar (2 parts Otterbein NHL5 hydraulic lime to 5 parts Cambusmore sand). Badly cracked and decayed rubble masonry would be indented as necessary in geologically matching red and buff sandstone, profiled and tooled to match the existing masonry.

Timberwork at windows would be repaired by replacing half cills and decayed window stiles with hardwood matching the same profile. Timber would be prepared and redecorated to an appropriate specification to match existing timberwork.

4. Representations received

No third party representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be considered with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling



HISTORIC
ENVIRONMENT
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD
EACHDRAIDHEIL
ALBA

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2: Control of works affecting scheduled monuments.

Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016

3.15. Monuments are subject to decay and the threat of destruction, from natural and human causes. Conservation work is normally needed to prolong the life of a monument, but there is a risk that this can be so invasive that it irreversibly modifies the monument's character and affects the special interest or features that made the monument important in the first place.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

b) Assessment

The proposed works involve the raking out of cementitious mortar and repointing areas on the rear (north) elevation of the Governor's House. It also includes some repairs to masonry and timber around windows where required. The works are intended to consolidate and conserve the building in the long-term.

The cementitious mortar that would be removed is an earlier repair and not part of the original fabric of the building. Its removal and replacement with a lime mortar, to match mortar used elsewhere in the building, would have beneficial effects on the appearance and long-term preservation of the building. Other repairs would remove decayed or failing masonry and timberwork; these would be replaced to match existing elements. Provided indented stonework replacement is kept to a minimum the repairs would result in some loss of historic fabric but have limited overall adverse effects on the cultural significance of the monument. However, no indication as to the extent of indenting has been provided.

However, the conservation works would maintain the structural integrity of the masonry and repair decayed fabric.

The repointing and other proposed repairs may be considered sound conservation work as they would retain as much historic fabric as possible and repair or replace failed fabric using techniques previously employed across this part of the monument.



With the exception of details on the extent of potential indenting, the application has been accompanied by drawings that set out an appropriately detailed and careful methodology.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

The work is not predicted to have any significant impacts on protected species because of its nature. Dumbarton Rock is a SSSI and SNH have been consulted during the application process. SNH have responded that the proposed works would not impact on the site's natural heritage designation.

d) Conclusion

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The proposed works, comprising raking out, repair and repointing, are required to conserve this part of the monument. The works would be done to elements of the monument in such a way that they would have limited impact on the cultural significance of the monument and be of benefit to its long term preservation and use. They do, therefore, comply with paragraphs 3.15 and 3.16 of the policy statement.

The application meets paragraph 3.20 because it has demonstrated that the works have been carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed and properly planned. However, in order to ensure indenting is kept to a minimum and to ensure that an accurate record is maintained a condition has been added.

6. Recommended decision

The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted, subject to the conditions detailed below.**

7. Conditions

1. No indenting shall take place until the extent has been agreed in writing beforehand by Historic Environment Scotland's Heritage Directorate.

To ensure that any impacts on historic fabric is minimized and that an accurate record of changes to the monument is maintained.



8. Approval

Case officer	Simon Stronach	Date	09 January 2017
Approved by	John Raven	Date	10 January 2017

Annex A – list of supporting documents

North Elevation Proposals Drawing 193-107-536