



Case information

Reference/Case ID	201601988		
Scheduled Monument	Scalloway Castle		
Index no	M90273	Grid Ref	HU404392 440500.0000 1139300.0000
Date of Application	13 July 2016	Application Received	13 July 2016
Summary of proposed works	Dismount steel yetts to ground floor and make demountable, blast clean and redecorate		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends approval without conditions.

2. Background

Scalloway Castle was built in the early 19th century for Patrick Stewart, the 2nd Earl of Orkney. The castle consists of four stories and a garret and would once have been surrounded by ancillary buildings, which are attested to both by historic sources and by archaeological exploration. It is situated on a small promontory extending out into the Voe of Scalloway. The castle is roofless but survives almost to wall-height.

The castle is significant for its relatively good state of preservation, its late date, its association with an important historical figure. In terms of setting, its prominence in the local area is significant as is its relationship to the promontory on which it is sited as this emphasises the defensive aspects of the monument. The views seaward and down the east Voe of Scalloway are likely to be significant as they assist in understanding the castle's relationship with the sea-power of the Earls of Orkney in the 17th century.

No pre-application discussions took place. The applicant provided more detailed information about the methodology for removing and replacing the fixing bars by e-mail upon request.

3. Proposals

The monument is secured on the ground floor by a substantial door and iron grilles on the windows which overlie covers of a thick durable plastic known as lexan. These features prevent litter, cat ingress and windsour. A statement was prepared by Kirsty

Owen, Cultural Resources Advisor at Historic Environment Scotland, demonstrating that these iron grilles are not historic and were installed after the property came into care. This statement was included as part of the SMC application. The works proposed are to undertake redecoration, alteration and replacement of various parts of these window coverings, as much of the metal work has become corroded.

The works proposed would comprise of:

- Removing and redecorating the existing iron grilles on the windows.
- Removing and replacing the existing lexan sheets in the windows.
- Altering the existing fixing bars to allow for easier removal in future.
- Re-fitting the redecorated grilles.

The lexan panels would be screwed out and removed.

The fixing bars are currently held by cement mortar. It is intended that this would be removed carefully by hand, using tungsten chisels. Some drilling of the cement mortar would take place to break it up if necessary. Any lead fixing encountered would be heat-softened in situ, although it is not considered likely that there would be a lead component to the fixings as they are perceived to be fairly modern in construction. If the fixing bars cannot be removed without unacceptable damage to the stonework the work would be halted. The fixing bars will then be altered by creating a bolted joint which would allow them to be more easily removed for repair and maintenance in future. They would be replaced within the current socket in the stone work and sealed using a combination of resin and lime mortar, ensuring no resin is visible.

The grilles would be removed along with the fixing bars and blast-cleaned, before being repainted. The fixing bars and grilles would then be replaced and new lexan panels, fitted with a stainless steel mesh vent in the centre would be shaped for each window opening and attached to the grills.

4. Representations received

No representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement (2016)

3.4. Scheduled monument consent is required for any works that would demolish, destroy, damage, remove, repair, alter or add to the monument or to carry out any flooding or tipping on the monument. It is a criminal offence to carry out any of these works without consent.

3.14. A monument is included in the Schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, *in situ* and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of this policy statement, that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.15 Monuments are subject to decay and the threat of destruction, from natural and human causes. Conservation work is normally needed to prolong the life of a monument, but there is a risk that this can be so invasive that it irreversibly modifies the monument's character and affects the special interest or features that made the monument important in the first place.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.17 As each monument will require treatment specific to its individual nature, characteristics, significance and needs, any proposed change to it must be fully and explicitly justified.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

b) Assessment

The works are required to ensure that the grilles and lexan panels are maintained. These prevent windscur and so protect the fabric of the monument. Included within the proposed works are measures designed to make similar repairs in future less invasive as it will remove the need for the fixing bars to be extracted from the stonework to remove the grills. The grills and panels also prevent litter and cat ingress, making the monument a more pleasant place to visit and so improving public enjoyment of the castle.

The proposed works are largely to modern material, namely the grilles on the windows, and so should not pose a significant risk to the historic fabric of the monument. The applicant has provided a clear methodology for the removal of the fixing bars, the part of the works most likely to damage the stonework: there appears to be little risk of physical impact. The grilles themselves will be replaced after redecoration and so should not alter the appearance of the windows. The new lexan panels will be slightly different in appearance but they are in keeping with those previously used and can be clearly identified by visitors as modern materials so do not alter the appreciation of the monument's overall character.

In terms of the monument's character, the changes will have no impact on views from in and around the castle, and would not be visible if viewing the castle from a distance. They should not therefore have any potential to adversely impact the visual appreciation of the monument.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

The application site does not lie in a Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI), Special Area of Conservation (SAC) or Special Protection Area. National Biodiversity Network GIS data sets indicate no evidence for Protected Species in the relevant 100m grid squares.

d) Conclusion

The works are required to maintain the physical fabric of the monument in future and are also designed to lessen the potential for damage to the stonework during future repairs. The grilles and lexan screens are part of presenting the castle for the public's amenity and enjoyment.

The proposals should have minimal effect on the character and physical fabric of the monument. Hence the cultural significance of the monument would not be materially affected and the proposals are not be inconsistent with paragraph 3.14 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

6. Recommended decision

The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted**.

7. Conditions

None

8. Approval

Officer	Kevin Grant	Date	20/07/2016
Approved by	John Raven	Date	25/07/2016

Annex A – list of supporting documents

- Location Plan
- Document by Kirsty Owen outlining history of the grilles
- Images of present grills which are amended to show proposed works. Detailed description given of works.