



Case information

| | | | |
|----------------------------------|--|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| Reference/Case ID | 201600076 | | |
| Scheduled Monument | Inchinnan, site of All Hallows Church | | |
| Index no | M2792 | Grid Ref | NS491681 249100.0000 668100.0000 |
| Date of Application | 06 April 2016 | Application Received | 05 April 2016 |
| Summary of proposed works | Excavations, as part of a wider community project, also consisting of geophysical survey, historical research and wider education programme. | | |

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends approval of an application for SMC for four archaeological excavation trenches as part of a much wider research and community engagement project.

2. Background

The scheduled monument and its cultural significance

The ecclesiastical history of this monument appears to have begun in the sixth century, with the establishment of a church and/or shrine by St Conval, although there is some evidence to suggest a slightly earlier origin. The survival of an excellent corpus of Hiberno-Norse sculpture, attributed to the Govan School, indicates that by the tenth to twelfth centuries it had royal connections and was fully integrated into the Kingdom of Strathclyde. As a result of twelfth-century ecclesiastical reforms the site became the main parish church for the area. It was granted to the Knights Templar and then the Knights of St John. The medieval stone-built church was replaced in the nineteenth century, although some of the earlier structure may have been incorporated into the new church building. This new church was in turn demolished and replaced in the early twentieth century. The creation of Glasgow Airport caused the final demolition of the church in 1967 and the parish centre was transferred to a new building to the north.

As part of this process, the finest examples of early and later medieval sculpture were removed and placed in this new church. Today, the footings and vaults of the church survive, surrounded by an enclosed graveyard exhibiting mostly nineteenth and twentieth-century graveyard furniture. The core of the site is surrounded by the remains of a number of enclosures, some associated with the later manse and

nearby farmsteads, but some appear to be much earlier in origin. The largest lies outwith the scheduled area, enclosed by a long curvilinear bank reminiscent of an early medieval *vallum*, a bank marking the edge of the sacred space more commonly associated with monastic centres. The recent discovery of a fragment of tenth to eleventh-century sculpture from the eroding bank at the edge of the river appears to confirm this interpretation. Another enclosure, within the scheduled area, bears the place-name 'Ladyfield', which perhaps indicates it was directly associated with the church in the later medieval period.

The scheduling recognises the site's importance as an early medieval church, its place in the history and structure of the Kingdom of Strathclyde, that it was the later medieval parish church, that it continued as a parish church into the twentieth century and that as the later phases now only survive as earthworks and a ruin, it presents an almost unique opportunity to study and investigate the development of ecclesiastical belief and expression from the founding days of Christianity to the present day. Many of those interred in the graveyard remain in living memory and many members of the community see the site as being as important to their community as the international centres of industry that once surrounded the site and further afield along the Clyde.

The church site now sits at the end of a runway and supports lighting essential to the safe running of the airport. Consequently, the site is surrounded by security fencing and access only provided in consultation with the airport authorities. Whilst the graveyard is regularly mown the surrounding enclosures have now largely succumbed to rank vegetation and are subsumed within overgrown scrub. Outside the security fencing the area is managed farmland.

Project Background

The project has been developed by a community group, the Inchinnan Historical Interest Group, in collaboration with professional and academic advisors, led by Dr Heather James of Northlight Heritage. The project is designed to deliver a number of strategic academic insights but also to provide benefits to the local community.

In recent years members of the local community formed the Inchinnan Historical Interest Group in order to record, raise interest in, and celebrate their history. They have undertaken and successfully delivered a broad spectrum of oral and local recent history projects. Amongst their primary aims has been a desire to seek local and wider recognition of the importance of their church heritage and earlier history, restore links between the community and the historic spiritual centre, and by drawing upon their history reinvigorate a pride of place amongst the local community, especially through education and amongst younger members of their community.

Due to their recognition of the importance of the site, the group contacted Historic Scotland (HES' predecessor body) in order to discuss what might be achieved there. This was followed by a site meeting and the opportunity for further work was recognised. The Group then widened out discussions with specialists in the area's history. This resulted in their employment of Northlight Heritage (a commercial

archaeological company with significant skills and experience in delivering complex archaeological excavations and working with community groups). Northlight worked with the Group, HS/HES and others, and have developed the Research Agenda and Project Design which forms the basis of this SMC application.

Project aims and objectives

The Research Agenda is highly comprehensive and considers all phases of the monument. It strongly reflects two themes highlighted by the Scottish Archaeological Research Forum's (ScARF) Medieval Research Panel: (1) state formation, and (2) medieval belief systems/mentalities. This feeds into four key research aims for the monument:

- To find evidence for St Conval & early European Monasticism.
- To discover the significance of the 10th-12th century carved stones.
- To explore the significance of the Knights Templars in the medieval period.
- To trace the later development of the church in the post-medieval and modern periods.

After much engagement the overall project has identified and focuses on four main aims:

- To investigate the site of the early-medieval shrine of St Conval and later churches.
- To record, research and disseminate information about Inchinnan and its carved stones.
- To provide opportunities to learn about archaeology, heritage and event planning.
- To encourage visitors to Inchinnan which will provide an economic benefit to the area.

The wider project will deliver a wide suite of education, training and volunteering opportunities and result in increased knowledge of the site and a more skilled and engaged community. In addition to work on the site itself, the project will undertake workshops in how to undertake research, desk-based assessments, carved stone recording and survey. This will be rolled out to local schools. An education pack and annual exhibition will be produced to encourage project legacy. A medieval music project will complement these activities. Excavation will also take place outwith the scheduled area.

3. Proposals

- Excavation of four archaeological trenches

These four trenches are proposed in order to reveal three features, identified as being necessary to answer key research questions:

- The oval-shaped enclosure around the medieval church.
- The medieval church and earlier shrine.
- The footprint of the two later churches.

Three of the trenches will be located within the footprint of the modern church buildings, the fourth outwith the modern graveyard.

Although not part of this application the first stage of activity on the site will be a geophysical survey (a separate application has been received and is being considered under Section 42 of the 1979 Act). The results from this survey work will inform the location of excavation trenches, allowing for trenches to be placed over interesting anomalies and to avoid graves and other features not related to the research questions.

The Project Design stipulates that the exact size and location of the trenches would be agreed with Historic Environment Scotland once the report on the geophysical survey has been submitted.

The three trenches within the graveyard enclosure are likely to be irregularly shaped, due to the need to avoid any features identified by the geophysical surveys and airport electrical services.

Two of the trenches are to locate the footprint of the two most recent churches and investigate the possibility for surviving remnants of the early and later medieval churches. It is anticipated that the trenches could cover an area as large as 30m x 7m: however, it is unclear if this is the potential size of each trench or if this is an indicative total for both trenches combined.

The other trench within the graveyard and the other one outwith it are designed to locate and investigate the potential survival of the earlier inner enclosure around the church, which may be early medieval in date and key to understanding the nature and form of the early church. Both could be as large as 8m x 1.5m, if space between burials and services allows. One would be located within the graveyard and has been designed to exploit a potential gap in graves caused by earlier walls and more recent path works. It will not take place if the geophysics does not confirm the likelihood of this gap. The other would be outwith the graveyard, just outside the modern walling which is likely to mark the line of the earlier enclosure.

All excavations would cease if complex deposits or structures, or in situ graves were encountered.

In general the excavation team would consist of 1 professional archaeologist to four volunteers, of varying skills and expertise. However, in more sensitive areas this ratio would change to 1:2.

The excavation methodology does not specify that all excavations would be by hand. The Project Design is, however, comprehensive and incorporates adequate methodologies strategies for sampling, finds recording, environmental recording, human remains, reporting and post-excavation.

4. Representations received

No representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979 is the legislative context for the Scheduled Monument Consent (SMC) process. *Scottish Historic Environment Policy 2011* set how applications shall be considered, the relevant sections are:

3.4. Scheduled monument consent is required for any works that would demolish, destroy, damage, remove, repair, alter or add to the monument or to carry out any flooding or tipping on the monument. It is a criminal offence to carry out any of these works without consent.

3.14. Scottish Ministers include a monument in the Schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of SHEP, that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.17. As each monument will require treatment specific to its individual nature, characteristics, significance and needs, any proposed change to it must be fully and explicitly justified.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

3.19. Extensive intervention will only be allowed where it is clearly necessary to secure the longer-term preservation of the monument, or where it will clearly generate public benefits of national importance which outweigh the impact on the national cultural significance of the monument. Such public benefits could come from, for example, interventions which make public access to scheduled monuments easier, or assist public understanding, or will produce economic benefits once the works are completed.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

3.22. Where consent for the range of works set out in paragraph 3.4 is granted, conditions are normally applied to ensure the works are undertaken in an appropriate manner. Common requirements are:

- a. the use of appropriate assessment methodologies to determine the full impact of any proposed management, use or development;
- b. the avoidance of irreversible change particularly wherever its effects cannot be adequately assessed;
- c. that where change is necessary, strategies should be adopted to mitigate its impact and limit intervention;
- d. that the management and execution of alteration, including remedial work, is sympathetic to the historic character;
- e. that appropriate skills and techniques, materials and construction techniques are specified where appropriate;
- f. that an appropriate level of record is made before, during and after any work and deposited in local and national archives, and, where appropriate, published;
- g. that it is possible, on close inspection, to differentiate new work from old particularly on masonry structures;
- h. that any archaeological excavation or other intrusive investigation should be based upon a detailed research strategy, with adequate resources, using appropriately skilled and experienced archaeologists with a satisfactory record of the completion and publication of projects (see Note 3.10); and,
- i. that the design, planning and execution of works on scheduled monuments are undertaken by people with appropriate professional and craft qualifications, skills and experience.

Consideration should also be paid to *The Treatment of Human Remains in Archaeology: Historic Scotland Operational Policy Paper 5 1997*.

b) Assessment

The project would see up to four excavation trenches opened up across the monument, to investigate and locate all phases of the church buildings on the site and the enclosing features. These are designed to address key academic research

questions, of national and local importance, as part of a suite of projects delivering significant educational, legacy and place-making benefits for the community.

Research agenda

The Research Agenda is robust and clear. There is a clear line of sight between key national research aims for Scotland, as identified by the Scottish Archaeological Research Forum's (ScARF) Medieval Research Panel – (1) state formation, and (2) medieval belief systems/mentalities – and those developed for this monument: (1) to find evidence for St Conval & early European Monasticism; (2) to discover the significance of the 10th-12th century carved stones; (3) to explore the significance of the Knights Templars in the medieval period, and; (4) to trace the later development of the church in the post-medieval and modern periods. This line of sight remains through the transfer of these key aims into the Project Design and the proposals for excavation at the site. The trenches have been carefully targeted in accordance with these aims.

Two of the trenches are to reveal the latest church and confirm and assess the level of survival of earlier, underlying church buildings, dating from the nineteenth century back to, potentially, the fifth or sixth centuries. These phases are key to understanding the site's history and confirmation of either or both date and survival will transform the understanding and appreciation of the site. They will provide detailed information on the site's early and medieval history, shedding light on what is currently relatively poor in relation to its earlier phases and dependant on a small corpus of documentary evidence. They will also provide a social and religious context for the associated sculpture. These results will, in turn, feedback, into placing the site and the project's results within the national research questions identified.

Excavators' Skills and Expertise

Northlight Heritage is an established and skilled archaeological consultancy, with a track record of delivering complex research projects in combination with education, training and other community outcomes. The methodologies proposed reflect national standards. The volunteer ratio identified should provide an appropriate level of supervision and control to prevent unintended damage caused by inexperienced excavators.

Project Feasibility

The project has secured, through the HLF, sufficient financial backing to support the delivery of the project, from excavation and supervision, through to reporting and post-excavation. The Project Design lays out, clearly, how this would be achieved and commits them to delivery through the consents process. However, whilst the methodology is clear that a Data Structure Report and Post Excavation Research Design will be completed within an agreed timeframe, the need for these to be sent to and approved by Historic Environment Scotland needs to be confirmed.

Reinstatement

Two of the trenches would be laid out over and around the footprint of the most recent church building. This is a robust structure, showing no signs of instability. Its exposure is unlikely to affect its long term survival. The Project Design indicates that there is no intention to remove the walls of this latest church, but this is not explicit. The other two trenches would be laid out over 'soft' deposits and not raise the same long term concerns.

All four trenches would be reinstated to existing ground levels and form upon completion of the project.

Methodology

Given the need to avoid sensitive services and burials it seems reasonable to accept that these precautions preclude against defining the exact size and location of the trenches at this stage, prior to application. The need to avoid some deposits whilst allowing for sufficient areas to be opened to investigation and allow informed interpretation of whatever is revealed means that the size of these two trenches are not excessive and are a proportionate balance between maintaining the churches' long term preservation and gaining the most information from any surviving deposits within the time available.

Locating evidence for an early medieval enclosure bank will be central to understanding the site, its origins and development. The nature of a bank and any dating or environmental deposits contained therein can be confirmed through a relatively modest intervention, such as the 1.5m wide trenches being proposed. The need to avoid other sensitive remains has also been recognised and also restricts any desire to widen the trenches.

All four trenches are designed to target key deposits, avoid other sensitivities and gain the most information through the most limited intervention. The recognition that the trench sizes and locations need to be discussed and agreed with Historic Environment Scotland prior to commencing the excavations should provide sufficient controls to ensure the interventions are not excessive and adequately targeted. However, it might be preferable to ensure any exchange was confirmed in writing, which would ensure a record of the interventions was maintained.

The excavation methodology allows for hand excavation elsewhere but does not confirm this is the intention within the scheduled area. This suggests that hand excavation is implicit, as would be expected, but this is not explicit. The Project Design offers a clear, well thought through and generally excellent strategy for considering environmental remains. However, as identified above, there are several areas where the Project Design is not as clear as it would ideally be. These issues are not fundamental to the overall project and do not undermine the otherwise

thoroughness of the Project Design. It is therefore recommended that clarification is provided through conditions.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

No European Protected Species have been identified as having the potential to be affected by these proposed works.

Although all steps will be taken to avoid articulated human remains, and not affect any Right of Sepulchre, it is likely that disarticulated human bones may be encountered. The proposed response strategy is sensitive to the rights of the deceased and has been discussed with the local kirk session and community to ensure the most relevant communities are content with the measures being taken.

d) Conclusion

The information recovered through these excavations will answer important research questions specific to this site, specifically about its development and transformation through several periods of significant religious and social change, including patterns of patronage. The results should further feed into national research agendas: shedding light on the understanding of the development of medieval belief systems/mentalities throughout the Middle Ages and up to the present day, as well as the creation of the kingdoms and state of Scotland. This will be all the more important as western central Scotland has in the past received comparatively little archaeological attention.

By feeding into these national research agendas the knowledge generated will have a significant public benefit in its own right. However, in addition to this wider academic benefit, the education and participation elements of the project will deliver a number of benefits to the local community. By raising awareness of the historical importance of Inchinnan, reconnecting the community with this important site and offering the opportunity for developing skills and engaging with their heritage these outcomes should help foster a sense of pride of place amongst diverse age and other groups within the community. The legacy aims should also help ensure that these outcomes are encouraged to have a lasting beneficial impact.

The excavation is not necessary for the monument's long term preservation, which would represent a departure from SHEP paragraph 3.16. However, the results, sitting within the context of the wider project would contribute to greater recognition of the monument's cultural significance. The Research Agenda clearly demonstrates the wider academic public benefits that would justify setting aside of the policy of minimum intervention. The education, outreach and legacy elements of the wider project would provide significant additional benefits, particularly to the local community. Together with the steps taken to minimise direct physical impacts on the fabric of the monument whilst maximising the amount of information to be gained, and tailoring these to rigidly and robustly fit the Research Agenda and wider Project

Aims, these benefits would be sufficient to set aside SHEP paragraph 3.16 and therefore conform to paragraph 3.19.

In general the works proposed in the Project Design are well thought through and represent an excellent expert approach, therefore complying with SHEP paragraphs 3.20 and 3.22. However, although the Project Design is implicit in a number of items which would ensure sufficient controls are in place to minimise the impacts of the works and sufficient reporting, these should be clarified in order to strengthen these controls and ensure compliance with SHEP. Therefore, a number of conditions have been recommended, specifically to allow: 1) a timetable to be provided to allow adequate monitoring; 2) written agreement of trench sizes and locations; 3) that the structural integrity of the most recent church's footings is not affected; 4) that all excavation shall be by hand; 5) that the Data Structure Report will be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland, and; 6) that the Post Excavation Research Design will be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland for approval.

6. Recommended decision

Subject to compliance with the schedule of conditions, the works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

It is recommended that consent is **granted, subject to the conditions detailed below.**

7. Conditions

1. Three weeks prior to the works commencing on site a written timetable of works shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland. Any changes to that timetable shall be notified to Historic Environment Scotland beforehand.

Reason: to notify Historic Environment Scotland of the intended start and completion date and ensure that a representative of Historic Environment Scotland has an opportunity to visit the monument and monitor the works in progress.

2. No ground breaking works shall commence on site until Historic Environment Scotland has confirmed the size and location of the trenches in writing.

Reason: to ensure any impacts on archaeological structures and deposits are minimised and to ensure that an accurate record of works at the monument is maintained.

3. No works shall take place which might remove or undermine the walls of the upstanding church footings.

Reason: to ensure that any impacts on the historic fabric are minimised and to ensure the long term survival of the site.

4. All ground breaking works and excavations shall be undertaken by hand, using hand tools only. No mechanical excavators or other machinery shall be used on site unless otherwise agreed in writing beforehand by Historic Environment Scotland.

Reason: to ensure sufficient controls are in place to minimise any unintended impacts on archaeological structures or deposits.

5. Within three months of each season's work being completed on site a copy of the Data Structure Report shall be submitted for approval by Historic Environment Scotland.

Reason: to ensure that an adequate and accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.

6. Within six months of the works finishing on site for the last season a copy of the Post Excavation Research Design shall be submitted for approval by Historic Environment Scotland.

Reason: to ensure that an adequate and accurate record of works to the monument is maintained and that the results are widely disseminated.

8. Approval

| | | | |
|--------------------|---------------------------|-------------|-------------------|
| Officer | John Raven | Date | 26/05/2016 |
| Approved by | Aonghus MacKechnie | Date | 27/05/2016 |

Annex A – list of supporting documents

1. Research Agenda – Inchinnan Research Agenda (v10)
2. Project Design – Inchinnan Heritage Project Design (v10)
3. Scheduled Area Location Plan – Scheduled area & geophysics areas
4. Permission letters from owners