

Case information

Reference/Case ID	201504890		
Scheduled Monument	Carnbane Castle, Glen Lyon		
Index no	M8996	Grid Ref	NN677478 267700.0000 747800.0000
Date of Application	02 November 2015	Application Received	03 November 2015
Summary of proposed works	Tree felling, timber extraction and removal of self seeded saplings from the masonry of the castle.		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that consent be granted.

2. Background

The monument comprises the remains of Carnbane Castle, which is situated on a steep sided spur above the River Lyon, commanding extensive views up and down the Glen. The spur is cut off from the rest of the river terrace by a deep ditch cut across its neck. Immediately behind this rises the wall of the hall-house, surviving in places up to about 5m in height. The area of the spur beyond (S of) the main building is defended by a wall now reduced to no more than 50cm in height. The castle in its present form probably dates from the 16th century.

HS/HES visited the monument in July 2015 to discuss the proposed felling with the forester responsible for the wood at that time. HS/HES has since undertaken pre-application discussions with the applicant regarding the approach to works, and this application accords with the outcome of these discussions.

3. Proposals

Consented Works – timber felling and removal of self seeded saplings

The proposals comprise:

- Felling of a large beech tree in the gully on the on the W side of the monument by hand
- Felling of a small oak tree by hand using a winch rope
- Directional felling of self seeded trees along the S and W boundaries of the monument
- Felling by hand of trees within the plateau/ yard immediately to the south of the main castle building
- Sapling to be removed from the walls of the castle by hand
- All timber to be extracted from within the monument by hand. Timber on the boundaries of the monument to be removed by winch to forwarder.
- All stumps treated with herbicide to prevent regrowth

4. Representations received

No representations were received with regard to this application.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

The Scottish Historic Environment Policy

3.14. Scottish Ministers include a monument in the Schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of SHEP, that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have

upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

b) Assessment

The works involve the felling of a small number of trees within the monument. The physical impact of these works on the monument will be minimal; the operation to remove the trees has been designed so that heavy machinery is kept outwith the monument and instead the harvester will lean in to grab, fell, and then lift the cut trees for processing outwith the scheduled area.

The existing growth of the trees within the scheduled area is likely to have already disturbed buried archaeological deposits and caused damage to upstanding masonry; removing the trees now will prevent further disturbance as the trees grow bigger.

It is therefore to the benefit of the long term preservation of the monument that the trees are removed now, and I consider that the prescribed methodology is acceptable.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

None.

d) Conclusion

The proposed works will be of benefit to the long term preservation of the monument. They will result in the removal of trees that will likely have been causing damage to archaeological deposits, and the methodology for removal is such that the operation to remove the trees will not cause additional damage or result in additional intervention to archaeological deposits.

The works can therefore be considered as the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument, and thus compliant with SHEP 3.16.

With the exception of the removal of a self seeded sapling, the majority of the works are being undertaken at the boundaries of the scheduled area away from the main castle block. Therefore I am content that the application is in line with SHEP 3.18 and that there is little potential for impact on the areas of the monument of greatest cultural significance.

6. Recommended decision

- The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

7. Conditions

None.

8. Approval

Officer	Rory McDonald	Date	25/11/2015
Approved by	George Findlater	Date	11/12/2015

Annex A – list of supporting documents

1. Location Map, Carnbane Castle
2. Method Statement, W Laing.