



## Case Information

|                            |                                                                                |          |                |
|----------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------|----------------|
| Reference/Case ID          | 300018726                                                                      |          |                |
| Scheduled Monument         | Union Canal, Fountainbridge to River Almond                                    |          |                |
| Index no                   | SM11097                                                                        | Grid ref | NT 20500 70200 |
| Date application validated | 24 November 2016                                                               |          |                |
| Summary of proposed works  | Groundworks and archaeological evaluation and monitoring at 9-11 Horne Terrace |          |                |

## 1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that approval for **Union Canal, Edinburgh: Groundworks and archaeological evaluation and monitoring at 9-11 Horne Terrace**, be granted with conditions.

## 2. Background

The monument is a section of the Union Canal.

The scheduled area relevant to this application comprises the canal and its banks.

The monument is of national importance as an integral part of the Union Canal and as an important component of Georgian civil engineering. Designed by a noted Scots Engineer, Hugh Baird, and built between 1818-23, its continuous watercourse was without need of a single lock and was graced by three major aqueducts inspired by another great Scots civil engineer, Thomas Telford.

It is the section of canal and its South bank, towards its eastern terminus and immediately north of Horne Terrace that this application relates to. The application is for a canalside footpath extension, landscaping works to the adjacent canal bank and the formation of a residential mooring. As part of these works, a programme of archaeological evaluation and monitoring is intended and this includes the excavation and recording of two test pits (each up to 1m x 2m in size). This application relates to a conjoining planning consent (reference number 16/02688/FUL, previously 14/03752/FUL) which is for the demolition of a redundant low rise industrial unit and



the erection of 11 residential apartments. It has been submitted by AMA (Majestic) Ltd.

The application is accompanied by nine relevant plans and drawings; a written scheme of investigation; technical reports on landscaping and piling works; a letter of support from Scottish Canals and; notes supporting the application.

HES Heritage Management Directorate has undertaken pre-application discussions with the applicant regarding the scope and timing of works, and this application accords with the outcome of those discussions.

### 3. Proposals

---

- Archaeological evaluation (via two test pits) and monitoring of all works within the relevant section of scheduled area.
- Removal of existing trees and vegetation.
- Sheet piling to canal bank.
- Creation of a footpath on canal bank.
- Regrading of the existing canal bank.
- Removal of an existing pontoon.
- Construction of a pontoon mooring.
- Soft landscaping between the footpath and the canal bank.

Consented works – Union Canal, Edinburgh: Groundworks and archaeological evaluation and monitoring at 9-11 Horne Terrace

Aims – The works are being undertaken as part of a wider scheme of redevelopment (under an allied planning consent at 9-11 Horne Terrace) and in the context of The Scottish Canals Fountainbridge Towpath Strategy / The Edinburgh Union Canal Strategy (Lochrin Basin Masterspace plan).

Personnel – Archaeological evaluation and monitoring works are to be undertaken by AOC Archaeology.

### 4. Representations received

---

The following third party representations have been received:

- Scottish Canals have indicated in written correspondence with Historic Environment Scotland (letter dated 17 November 2016) that *"Scottish Canals are fully supportive of this programme of archaeological work at 9-11 Horne*



*Terrace and the Scheduled Monument Consent application lodged by AOC Archaeology Group".*

## 5. Report

---

### a) Policy considerations

The application should be considered with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

#### Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2: Control of works affecting scheduled monuments.

#### Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016

3.15. Monuments are subject to decay and the threat of destruction, from natural and human causes. Conservation work is normally needed to prolong the life of a monument, but there is a risk that this can be so invasive that it irreversibly modifies the monument's character and affects the special interest or features that made the monument important in the first place.

3.17. As each monument will require treatment specific to its individual nature, characteristics, significance and needs, any proposed change to it must be fully and explicitly justified.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

3.22. Where consent for the range of works set out in paragraph 3.4 is granted, conditions are normally applied to ensure the works are undertaken in an appropriate manner. Common requirements are:

- a. the use of appropriate assessment methodologies to determine the full impact of any proposed management, use or development;
- b. the avoidance of irreversible change particularly wherever its effects cannot be adequately assessed;



- c. that where change is necessary, strategies should be adopted to mitigate its impact and limit intervention;
- d. that the management and execution of alteration, including remedial work, is sympathetic to the historic character;
- e. that appropriate skills and techniques, materials and construction techniques are specified where appropriate;
- f. that an appropriate level of record is made before, during and after any work and deposited in local and national archives, and, where appropriate, published;
- g. that it is possible, on close inspection, to differentiate new work from old particularly on masonry structures;
- h. that any archaeological excavation or other intrusive investigation should be based upon a detailed research strategy, with adequate resources, using appropriately skilled and experienced archaeologists with a satisfactory record of the completion and publication of projects; and
- i. that the design, planning and execution of works on scheduled monuments are undertaken by people with appropriate professional and craft qualifications, skills and experience.

## **b) Assessment**

The proposed works involve the limited archaeological investigation of the canal bank to the North of 9-11 Horne Terrace and subsequent groundworks to improve access and amenity to the canalside. The archaeological monitoring of the groundworks is part of the application and is the subject of a written statement of investigation. The works to this small section of the canal are part of a wider redevelopment strategy affecting the Union canal and improved access and amenity of the Lochrin Basin hub.

The physical impact of the proposed works would be two areas of trenching (each 1mx2m), the removal of an overburden of vegetation, trees and deposited dredge material; the redesign and restructuring of the canal bank with sheet piles, landscaping and new vegetation and the attachment of a new berthing pontoon.

The benefit of these works is likely to be the improved understanding of the character and condition of archaeological deposits along this section of the canal; the stabilisation of the canal bank structure; improvements to waterside access and general amenity and appearance consistent with adjacent improvements around Lochrin Basin.

The physical impact of these works on the monument and its cultural significance would be comparatively minor, but the benefits brought about by improved access and amenity (as part of the wider improvements to the Lochrin Basin area of the canal) are significant.

# Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling



HISTORIC  
ENVIRONMENT  
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD  
EACHDRAIDHEIL  
ALBA

The excavation of two small test pit areas would remove archaeological deposits and artefacts from the monument and consequently be destructive. The trench dimensions are restricted to 2m by 1m and cover a relatively small proportion of the scheduled monument. Given the size of the trenches relative to the monument they would not have a material effect on the monument's overall archaeological value.

The results of the work may improve our understanding of issues related to the monument's conservation, in particular the structure of the canal bank and its long term conservation and the nature of archaeological deposits adjacent to the bank.

The application has been accompanied by a detailed Project Design/WSI that sets out a well-considered, appropriate and careful methodology. The specified method of the work is appropriate to ensure it is undertaken to a professional standard, including post excavation, reporting and archiving. It reflects all professional expectations. The WSI includes for making a record of the work publicly available. This would advance our understanding of engineering nature of the canal and the creation of such a record as a component of the overall understanding of the Union Canal is assessed as a considerable benefit.

## **c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places**

No impact on Protected Species and Places considered likely – see PP&S assessment.

## **d) Conclusion**

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The works, comprising **Union Canal, Edinburgh: Groundworks and archaeological evaluation and monitoring at 9-11 Horne Terrace**, are being done to elements of the monument in such a way that they will have minimal impact on the cultural significance of the monument. The works would involve controlled archaeological excavation within a relatively small part of the scheduled monument. The excavations cover a relatively small area of the overall monument, sufficient to characterise the nature and condition of archaeological deposits here. The excavations would leave the majority of the overall site's archaeological deposits intact. It is concluded that they would have minimal material effect on the overall significance of the monument and are, therefore, not inconsistent with paragraphs 3.16 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

The proposed work includes improvements to public access and amenity and have therefore been justified in accordance with paragraph 3.17 of the policy statement.

# Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling



HISTORIC  
ENVIRONMENT  
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD  
EACHDRAIDHEIL  
ALBA

In order to ensure the works comply with the policy statement conditions as outlined in paragraph 3.22 are considered necessary.

## 6. Recommended decision

---

Subject to compliance with the schedule of conditions, the works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted, subject to the conditions detailed below.**

## 7. Conditions

---

1. Not less than 2 weeks before any of the works to which this consent relates are begun on site, Historic Environment Scotland shall be informed in writing of the timetable for the proposed works. Historic Environment Scotland shall be informed in writing of any changes to the timetable prior to the works being carried out.

*Reason: to enable a representative of Historic Environment Scotland to monitor the works in progress.*

2. Within 3 months of the end of fieldwork the applicant shall submit to Historic Environment Scotland a Data Structure Report (as defined in Historic Scotland 1996 Project Design, Implementation and Archiving. Historic Scotland Archaeological Procedures Paper 2). This shall also be copied to the Sites and Monuments Record of the City of Edinburgh Council.

*Reason: to enable Historic Environment Scotland to monitor the progress of the work which is subject to consent and to ensure that a written record of the archaeological work is presented in an accessible form.*

## 8. Approval

---

|                     |               |             |                 |
|---------------------|---------------|-------------|-----------------|
| <b>Case officer</b> | Andrew Fulton | <b>Date</b> | 11 January 2017 |
| <b>Approved by</b>  | Iona Murray   | <b>Date</b> | 11 January 2017 |



## Annex A – list of supporting documents

- |                                                                                                                                                         |                                                 |
|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|
| 1. A note on the application describing the proposed development including the work required with the Scheduled Area                                    | 161116-SMC Application Notes-<br>Rev 2          |
| 2. Location plan with reference to Item 1 of this list                                                                                                  | 2147 (00)001A Location Plan                     |
| 3. Ground Floor Plan-Proposed with reference to Item 1 of this list                                                                                     | 2147 (00)1000C Ground Floor Plan<br>- Proposed  |
| 4. Upper Floor Plans-Proposed with reference to Item 1 of this list                                                                                     | 2147 (00)1001C Upper Floor Plans<br>- Proposed  |
| 5. Northern Elevation—Proposed with reference to Item 1 of this list                                                                                    | 2147 (00)1002C Northern Elevation<br>- Proposed |
| 6. Side Elevations—Proposed with reference to Item 1 of this list                                                                                       | 2147 (00)1004C Side Elevations –<br>Proposed    |
| 7. A landscaping report                                                                                                                                 | 16030_161111_1.5_Landscape_S<br>MCApplication   |
| 8. Drawing with reference to Item 7 of this list                                                                                                        | 16030_L_200_E04 General<br>Arrangement          |
| 9. Section A-A with reference to Item 7 of this list                                                                                                    | 16030_L_400_E03 Section A - A                   |
| 10. Section B-B with reference to Item 7 of this list                                                                                                   | 16030_L_401_E01 Section B – B                   |
| 11. A specification detailing the nature of the works required for the sheet piling                                                                     | 13046 Sheet Piling Specification                |
| 12. A Written Scheme of Investigation detailing the archaeological evaluation and monitoring works to be undertaken in conjunction with the development | AOC_23617 9-11 Horne Terrace<br>WSI v2          |
| 13. A statement from Scottish Canals indicating that they are content with the development and the methods set out in the WSI                           | 3765_001                                        |