



## Case Information

---

<b>Reference/Case ID</b>	300018682		
<b>Scheduled Monument</b>	Kinclaven Castle		
<b>Index no</b>	SM1640	<b>Grid ref</b>	NO 15800 37700
<b>Date application validated</b>	07 November 2016		
<b>Summary of proposed works</b>	Masonry & mortar survey and sampling and analysis		

### 1. Summary recommendation

---

This report recommends that approval for masonry and mortar survey, sampling and analysis be granted with conditions..

### 2. Background

---

The monument comprises Kinclaven Castle, a square enclosure measuring externally 130 feet. The principal entrance was situated near the S end of the W side with a postern in the centre of the S frontage. There is no vestige of interior buildings but indications of a ditch are visible in part. The remaining upstanding walls are ruinous, varying from 6 - 10ft high.

Kinclaven Castle is ascribed a 13th-century construction date by MacGibbon and Ross on the basis of a number of documentary references suggesting that the site had been a royal residence throughout the late 13th and 14th-centuries. The Castle Hill earthwork may represent the remains of an earlier castle building.

The scheduled area is the area to the W of the bank of the river Tay measuring 130 feet squared, with the east most corner situated 130 feet N/W of the bank at its nearest point and 380 feet W and N of the parish boundaries of Kinclaven, Caputh and Kargill and 890 feet S/W of Kinclaven Bridge.

The monument is of national importance as an example of Scottish quadrilateral enclosure castles, its potential to provide further information about this important period of Scotland's past and its association with historic events and personalities.



It is the four remaining upstanding walls, specifically loose masonry and mortar, that this application relates to. The application is for masonry and mortar survey, sampling and analysis and has been submitted as part of a research project by the University of Stirling.

The application is accompanied by supporting documents and has been informed by a rapid preliminary survey. It is possible to complete the proposed survey from ground levels with use of a stepladder only to access primary mortar. Loose masonry and mortar from the SE wall has been assessed to have good research potential for microcharcoal and binder measurement and a general analysis of mortar at Kinclaven Castle was assessed as having good potential to inform our understanding of the development of the monument.

The proposed work forms part of the Scottish Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project and has been discussed with HES Casework Team in advance. This included email correspondence during the application regarding the proposed reporting arrangements. The application is supported by a report of the preliminary survey and a sampling strategy document. This application accords with the outcome of those discussions.

### 3. Proposals

---

- Collection of mortar samples from several contexts.
- Removal from site for lab-based analysis.

**Consented works** – 2 – 5 small mortar samples, from an area measuring approximately 50 x 50 x 50mm to be extracted from each of the four walls. 10 - 25 smaller samples (approximately 0.5g or 1 cm<sup>3</sup>) containing relict fuel will also be extracted.

The samples would be removed using hand tools. No samples would be retrieved where the masonry is considered fragile or where sample removal is likely to accelerate the deterioration of the monument in any way.

The samples would be stored appropriately. They would be thin sectioned and examined using effective types of microscopy. Samples would be radiocarbon dated by the SUERC laboratory.

The site work would be described in a short report, with a plan showing the sample contexts, to be supplied to HES within 4 weeks of the completion of site works. A full report would be submitted following completion of all analyses. Any variation to the reporting arrangements would be subject to agreement with HES.

# Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling



HISTORIC  
ENVIRONMENT  
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD  
EACHDRAIDHEIL  
ALBA

Personnel – The work will be undertaken by a suitably experienced academic and a qualified stonemason licensed under HES' construction Site Certification Scheme from the University of Stirling, who has successfully undertaken similar work at other monuments.

## 4. Representations received

---

No third party representations were received.

## 5. Report

---

### a) Policy considerations

The application should be considered with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

#### Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

Part 1 Section 2 (3) – authorises works where Scottish Ministers or Historic Environment Scotland have granted consent (scheduled monument consent) for the execution of the works where the works are executed in accordance with the terms of the consent and of any conditions attached to the consent.

#### Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016

3.14. A monument is included in the schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of this policy statement that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

### b) Assessment

The proposed works involve the retrieval and removal of small mortar samples from a limited number of locations at Kinclaven Castle. This work forms part of the Scottish

# Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling



HISTORIC  
ENVIRONMENT  
SCOTLAND

ÀRAINNEACHD  
EACHDRAIDHEIL  
ALBA

Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project, which aims to improve our understanding of the development of these structures. The development of Kinclaven Castle is poorly understood and subject to debate. The proposed work has the potential to significantly increase our understanding of this monument, and, more generally, the development of castles throughout Scotland.

The physical impact of the proposed works would be minor and it is proposed to remove a number of mortar samples from locations that have been identified during preliminary survey. The work would be undertaken by a suitably experienced archaeologist with a stonemasonry qualification. They would ensure that samples were retrieved from locations with the potential to increase our understanding of the monument whilst not adversely affecting the cultural significance of the monument. The removal of these samples would have no substantive physical impact on the monument and would not visually alter it. The cultural significance of the monument would be unaltered by the work.

Because the works would not affect the conservation or cultural significance of the monument they are consistent with paragraphs 3.14 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

The application is supported by the results of a preliminary survey and proposed strategy. Taken together these provide a strong justification and a carefully considered methodology for site works and subsequent analyses. The project team are highly experienced and have an established track record of successful delivery of similar projects; the work forms part of the Scottish Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project

The application has been accompanied by a detailed Project Design that sets out a well-considered, appropriate and careful methodology. However, no provision for reporting has been added.

## **c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places**

No impact on Protected Species and Places considered likely – see PP&S assessment.

## **d) Conclusion**

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The proposed works, comprising mortar sampling and analyses, would have no impact on the cultural significance of the monument and therefore do not conflict with 3.18 of the policy statement.



However, the application contains no provision for reporting, two conditions have therefore been added.

## 6. Recommended decision

---

Subject to compliance with the schedule of conditions, the works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted, subject to the conditions detailed below.**

## 7. Conditions

---

1. A short report detailing the location of the mortar samples shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland within three weeks of the works being completed on site.

*Reason: to ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.*

2. Within six months of the works being completed on site the final report on the results of the mortar analysis shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland.

*Reason: to ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.*

## 8. Approval

---

<b>Case officer</b>	Hazel Johnson	<b>Date</b>	20 December 2016
<b>Approved by</b>	John Raven	<b>Date</b>	20 December 2016

### Annex A – list of supporting documents

- Preliminary Survey – Ref: SC14-KCP-PRE-01
- Sampling Strategy – Ref: SC14-KCP-PRE-02