Scheduled Monument Consent: Report on Handling

Case Information

Reference/Case ID	300018752		
Scheduled Monument	Lochindorb Castle		
Index no	SM1231	**Grid ref**	NH 97400 36300
Date application validated	24 November 2016		
Summary of proposed works	Programme of masonry materials survey, sampling and analysis		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that approval for a programme of masonry materials survey, sampling and analysis at Lochindorb Castle be granted with conditions.

2. Background

The monument is comprised of the substantial remains of a 13th-century castle on an island which may itself be partly or wholly artificial. The castle is defined by a large quadrilateral curtained wall with round towers at each corner. A further forewall lies to the south of the main enclosure. Some traces can be seen of internal structures such as the 'chapel' and east range. The walls are in relatively good condition and survive largely to wall-height. The scheduled area includes the fabric of the castle and the entirety of the island on which it lies.

The monument is of national importance because of its good condition, archaeological potential, architectural interest and association with a number of important historical figures such as Alexander Stewart, the 'Wolf of Badenoch'.

It is the curtain walls of the castle that this application relates to. The application is for sampling of mortars within the castle as part of an HES-funded research project into Scotland's Castles.The application is accompanied by preliminary mortar and masonry survey of the castle and a preliminary sampling and analysis strategy.

The work is part of a much wider programme of sampling and HES Heritage Management Directorate has undertaken pre-application discussions with the applicant regarding the scope and timing of works. This application accords with the outcome of those discussions.

3. Proposals

- 3-6 small mortar samples measuring c 50 x 50 x 50mm will be taken from the curtain wall of the castle and from the east range.
- A further 5-20 small mortar samples measuring around 1cm3 will also be taken from mortars across the site.
- A single small 50 x 50 x 50cm sample will be removed from sandstone dressings on site if a loose sample is available.

Consented works - Programme of masonry materials survey, sampling and analysis

It is proposed to sample historic mortars on the monument by removing a small number of samples from exposed masonry.

Samples will be removed by a qualified stonemason using a masonry hammer and chisel and a strong knife, avoiding fragile or structurally sensitive areas. All contexts to be sampled will first be recorded using a scaled photograph, and the location of each sample will be recorded using hand-measurements from fixed points and with the assistance of building survey data.

The samples will then be used for lab-based mortar analysis and radiocarbon dating.

4. Representations received

No third party representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be considered with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2: Control of works affecting scheduled monuments.

Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016

3.14. A monument is included in the schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of this

policy statement that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.17. As each monument will require treatment specific to its individual nature, characteristics, significance and needs, any proposed change to it must be fully and explicitly justified.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

b) Assessment

The sampling will result in the removal of mortar from in situ construction deposits. However, the samples will be very small in comparison to the overall monument. They will also be removed from exposed areas which are liable to being washed out due to environmental effects and are not structurally fundamental. The works will be undertaken by a qualified stone mason certified under the HES Construction Skills Certification Scheme who will select areas which are not fragile or sensitive for sampling. The physical impacts will therefore be slight. The works would not affect the cultural significance of the monument.

The sampling is being undertaken under an HES-funded project, which is highly innovative and ground breaking. It therefore has the potential to increase the cultural significance of the monument by increasing our understanding of the chronology of the building's features and the date and manner of its construction.

However, no timetable for reporting has been provided.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

No impact on Protected Species and Places considered likely due to the nature of the works.

d) Conclusion

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The impacts on the physical fabric of the monument are minimal and due to their limited nature should not have the potential to negatively affect the cultural significance of the castle.

The purpose of the work is to undertake research supported by HES which has the potential to greatly increase our understanding of castles and therefore may enhance how such buildings are understood and presented to the wider public. It may therefore enhance the cultural significance of the monument. They do not, therefore, conflict with paragraphs 3.16 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

It is essential that a timetable for reporting be provided in order that a record of the sample location and the results is maintained. As there is no provision for reporting within the application two conditions have been added.

6. Recommended decision

Subject to compliance with the schedule of conditions, the works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted, subject to the conditions detailed below**.

7. Conditions

1. A short report detailing the location of the mortar samples shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland within three weeks of the works being completed on site.

   To ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.

2. Within six months of the works being completed on site the final report on the results of the mortar analysis shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland.

   To ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.

8. Approval

Case officer	Kevin Grant	**Date**	16 December 2016
Approved by	John Raven	**Date**	16 December 2016

Annex A – list of supporting documents

- Preliminary mortar and Masonry Survey of Lochindorb Castle.
- Proposed materials sampling and analysis strategy and Lochindorb Castle