



Case information

Case ID	300017718		
File Reference	HGH/B/LA/506		
Name of Site	Gatepiers at West Shore Road, well and bridge in the grounds of Caroline Park House		
Local Authority	City of Edinburgh Council		
National Grid Reference	NT 22740 77351		
Designation No. (if any)	LB28041 (gatepiers only)		
Designation Type	Listed Building	Current Category of Listing	B (gatepiers)_
Case Type	Amendment		
Received/Start Date	18/01/2016		
Decision Date	01/11/2016		

1. Decision

In our current state of knowledge, this pair of gatepiers continue to meet the criteria for listing at category B. The statutory listing address and the listed building record have been amended. The well and bridge are not considered to meet the criteria for listing.

Current Statutory Address	West Shore Road, Gatepiers to north east of Caroline Park House
Proposed Statutory Address	Gatepiers to northeast of Caroline Park House, West Shore Road, Edinburgh

2. Designation Background and Development Proposals

2.1 Designation Background

These gatepiers were listed at category B on the 14/12/1966. The listed building record has been revised since this date.

2.2 Development Proposals

There are no known development proposals.

3. Assessment

3.1 Assessment information

Caroline Park House was visited on the 18/03/2016. The gatepiers, well and bridge were seen at this visit.

3.2 Assessment against designation criteria

The gatepiers were found to meet the criteria for listing. The well and bridge were not found to meet the criteria for listing.

An assessment against the listing criteria was carried out. See **Annex A**.

The designation criteria are published in the Historic Environment Scotland policy statement June 2016, Annex 2, pp. 51-53.

<https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/planning-and-guidance/legislation-and-guidance/historic-environment-scotland-policy-statement/>

Elizabeth McCrone

Head of Designations
Heritage Management
Historic Environment Scotland

Contact	Rosanne Watts, Senior Designations Officer rosanne.watts@hes.scot, 0131 668 8091
----------------	---

ANNEX A – Assessment Against the Listing Criteria*

Gatepiers to northeast of Caroline Park House, West Shore Road, Edinburgh

1. Description

Gatepiers: circa 1690 with alterations and additions, pair of sandstone ashlar gatepiers with classical detailing to the northeast of Caroline Park House. The main gatepiers are square plan with alternating pulvinated bands between bands with fielded panels, as well as a moulded base and cornice. Adjoining the inner side of each pier is a lower coped wall with pedestrian entrances, probably added in the mid-18th century. The vehicular entrance between the walls has been bricked up. Adjoining the outer face of each pier are lower coped rubble walls, probably 19th century.

Well: rubble fragments of a curved wall of a small circular well to the east of Caroline Park House. Some squared and dressed stones to the north part.

Bridge: possibly early 18th century small stone arched footbridge over the Granton Burn and to the south of Caroline Park House.

2. Assessment Against the Listing Criteria (HES Policy Statement, 2016) Annex 2, pp. 51-52

Criteria for determining whether a building is of 'special architectural or historic interest' for listing under the terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 [www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1997/9/contents]

To be listed, a building need not meet all the listing criteria. The criteria provide a framework within which judgement is exercised in reaching individual decisions.

2.1 Age and Rarity

Gatepiers

Incorporating fabric of a 1585 mansion, Royston House (later Caroline Park House) was extensively extended and remodelled between 1685-96 for the politician and polymath, Sir George Mackenzie of Tarbat, 1st Earl of Cromarty (1631-1714). From 1693 the main approach to the house was moved from the north to the south and a new, grand south elevation to the house was created.

To the northeast of the house are a pair of gatepiers that mark the location of a former 'sea-gate' to Caroline Park House from the north. When the main approach was moved to the south the north gate was maintained as a useful commercial route into the policies from the Forth coast road until the 19th century, and this access is evident on Edgar's circa 1739 plan of the estate.

The gatepiers are similar in design to a pair of giant pilasters with alternating pulvinating bands that clasp the corners of the slightly advanced central entrance bay on the south elevation of Caroline Park House. It is likely that the gatepiers date from around the 1693-6 remodelling of the south elevation. The remodelling of the south elevation may have been to designs by the renowned Scottish architect, William Bruce, because of its similarity to the Palace of Holyroodhouse (listed at category A, LB28022), which Bruce rebuilt in 1671, along with mastermason, Robert Mylne. Bruce was a friend of Tarbat and there is a bond for a sum of money to Robert Mylne, however, there is no evidence for this being a payment for work (Clough, 1990, p.132). The gatepiers therefore might be the work of William Bruce and/or Robert Mylne.

It is unclear whether these gatepiers were built as part of the main southern entrance approach and moved to their current location at a later date (Currie 2001, p13) or whether they were intended to be an imposing rear approach to the house. The gatepiers are not shown on the 6 inch 1st Edition Ordnance Survey map (published 1855), however a map of this scale would not always depict small ancillary structures such as gatepiers. They are shown in their present location on the 25 inch 2nd Edition Ordnance Survey Map (published 1895).

In 1739 John Campbell, 2nd Duke of Argyll (1678-1743) purchased Royston House. He gifted it to his daughter, Lady Caroline Campbell, on her marriage into the Buccleuch family, and named the estate after her. It remained in the Buccleuch family's ownership until 1872-1966 when it was bought by the printing ink firm Fleming & Co.

Buildings erected before 1840 which are of notable quality and survive predominantly in their original form have a strong case for listing. Gatepiers are a common feature of private estates and villas across Scotland. This set of circa 1690 gatepiers are very imposing and a sophisticated example of late 17th century gatepier design, which have been altered by the loss of the iron gates and the decoratively scrolled finials.

Well

To the east of the house are the rubble fragments of a curved wall of a small circular well (NT 22722 77216). The date of the well at Caroline Park is not known. A well is referred to in William Wright's 1703 bill for work at the estate (see Clough, 1990, p.138) but it is not known where this well was located. A well is not indicated on the 18th century estate plans and is first marked on the 1st Edition Ordnance Survey (published 1853). Some of the stone to the north part of the structure is squared and dressed suggesting that this was the opening to the well.

Around 120 wells are listed in Scotland. These range from public wells and drinking fountains, wellhouses for mineral springs as well as ancillary estate structures. Examples of estate wells include the early 19th century, domed, circular-plan well house at Rosneath Castle in Argyll (listed at category C, LB42629), the early 19th century ornamental well at Castle Semple in Renfrewshire (listed at category C,

LB12634) and the early 19th century circular well house at Buchanan Castle (listed at category B, LB50454). In comparison with other listed examples, the well at Caroline Park House is only a fragmentary survival and does not display a high level of craftsmanship and decoration. It is not considered to meet the listing criteria in its own right, however it is an ancillary estate structure for Caroline Park House (listed at category A, LB28040).

Bridge

To the south of the house is a small stone arched bridge (NT 22683 77090) over the Granton Burn, which is partially culverted in this part of the garden. A bridge over the burn is shown in roughly the same location as this bridge on the 18th century estate plans, including Edgar's of circa 1739, so this bridge may date from the early 18th century. In terms of design quality this bridge is unexceptional. It is not considered to meet to the listing criteria in its own right, however it is an ancillary estate structure of Caroline Park House (listed at category A, LB28040).

2.2 Architectural or Historic Interest

Interior

N/A

Plan form

N/A

Technological excellence or innovation, material or design quality

The **gatepiers** are well detailed, particularly the alternating pulvinated bands between bands with fielded panels, and their design directly reference the south elevation of Caroline Park House. Their scale and position overlooking West Shore Road create an imposing entrance. It is not known when the pedestrian entrances were added to the piers and they are shown in MacGibbon and Ross's 1887 drawing of the gates.

The former gate was described by Lord Cockburn, who lived here in his youth as "a composition of strong iron filigree, [...] the grandest gate in Scotland" (see MacGibbon and Ross, 1887, p.462). In the early 19th century the iron gates were removed by Lord Cockburn's father to the entrance of Gogar House (see separate listing, LB27112) (Harris, circa 1896).

A variety of 19th century drawings and photographs of the gatepiers (including MacGibbon and Ross, 1887, p.455) show each pier topped by a carved, crocketed and scrolled finial which is surmounted by small ball with a crown. These finials were removed around the mid 20th century. They are still evident in a photograph by B. C. Clayton which is understood to date from circa 1950 as well as photograph by Ian G. Lindsay which is likely to be of a similar date (both of these photographs are held at HES' collection at John Sinclair House). The finials do not appear in a photograph in Fenwick's 1966 article for *Edinburgh Tatler*. The removal of these finials as well as the blocked infilling to the gateway has had an impact on the historic character and authenticity of these gatepiers.

Setting

The **gatepiers** are an important ancillary component of Caroline Park House and make a contribution to the wider estate. Their survival within an area of major industry and rapid built development in the 19th century is noteworthy. It is not known if these gatepiers remain in their original location or have been moved. However, they are an important reminder of an earlier 'sea-gate' and a visual relationship between Caroline Park House and these gatepiers has been maintained. The principal central vehicular access has been blocked by brick infill and this entrance is now inaccessible from the road below.

Regional variations

There is no known regional variations.

2.3 Close Historical Associations

None known at present.

Caroline Park is associated with a number of individuals and families who achieved lasting renown, including Sir George Mackenzie (1631-1714), and the Dukes of Buccleuch. People of significant social standing commissioned houses and the development of their estates and the association with these people is not a significant factor in this assessment for listing.

3. Working with the Principles of Listing (HES Policy Statement, 2016) Annex 2, pp. 53

In choosing buildings within the above broad headings particular attention is paid to:

- a. special value within building types*
- b. contribution to an architecturally or historically interesting group*
- c. the impact of a grouping of buildings*
- d. authenticity*

When working with the principles of listing the gatepiers at Caroline Park House has particular interest under a and b.

- a. An imposing set of 17th century **gatepiers** of good quality stonework.
- b. The **gatepiers** are an important ancillary component of Caroline Park House and make a significant architectural contribution to the wider estate.

4. Summary of Assessment Against the Listing Criteria**

This set of circa 1690 **gatepiers** are very imposing and a sophisticated example of late 17th century gatepier design. The gatepiers have well detailed stonework with

alternating pulvinated bands between bands with fielded panels. They are an important ancillary component of Caroline Park House that evidence the development of the estate and a reminder of an earlier 'sea-gate'. In our current state of knowledge it continues to meet the criteria for listing.

In our current state of knowledge the **well** and small **bridge** are not considered to meet the criteria for listing.

5. Category of Listing

Categories of listing are non-statutory and buildings are assigned a category (A, B or C) according to their relative importance following the assessment against the criteria for listing.

Category definitions are found at: <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/listing-scheduling-and-designations/listed-buildings/what-is-listing/>

Category B is for buildings of regional or more than local importance; or major examples of some particular period, style or building type, which may have been altered. The gatepiers at Caroline Park are an imposing and well detailed example of late 17th century gatepiers. They have been altered by the loss of the decorative finials and iron gates and they no longer serve as an entrance to the property. They are therefore considered to be a major example of their building type which have been altered. Category B remains the most appropriate category of listing.

6. Other Information

N/A

7. References

Canmore: <http://canmore.org.uk/>CANMORE ID 122248

Maps

Edgar, W. (c.1739) *Plan of the Inclosures of Royston* (Historic Environment Scotland EDD/46/59).

(c.1760) SURVEY OF GROUNDS OF CAROLINE PARK in Bute sale, Sotheby's catalogue of 1951 (Historic Environment Scotland EDD/46/53/PO).

Bell, W. (c.1768) *Plan of Caroline Park* (reproduced in Johnson and Campbell 2010).

(1768) *Estates of Caroline Parke & Oyster Scalp in the Parishes of St Cuthberts and Cramond*, Buccleuch Drawings (Bowhill) (Historic Environment Scotland EDD/44/64).

Ordnance Survey (surveyed 1852, published 1853) Edinburgh, Sheet 2. 6 inches to 1 mile. 1st Edition. Southampton: Ordnance Survey.

Ordnance Survey (resurveyed 1893-4, published 1895) Edinburgh, Sheet 1.14. 25 inches to 1 mile. 2nd Edition. Southampton: Ordnance Survey.

Printed sources

Clough, M. (1990) *Two houses: New Tarbat, Easter Ross; Royston House, Edinburgh*. Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press.

Cockburn, H. (1874) *The Journal of Henry Cockburn, being a continuation of the Memorials of his time*. Edinburgh.

Currie, C. K. (2001) *An archaeological desk-based assessment of Caroline Park, Granton, Edinburgh, Lothian, Scotland*, Report to Waterfront Edinburgh.

Fenwick, H (1966) 'Caroline Park' in *The Edinburgh Tatler*, February 1966.

Gifford, J., McWilliam, C. and Walker, D. (1991) *The Buildings of Scotland: Edinburgh*. London: Penguin Books. p.608.

Grant, J. (1979) *Old and New Edinburgh*. Volume III. Newtongrange: Lang Syne Publishers. p.312.

Harris, D F. (1896) *Caroline Park House and Roystoun Castle: a descriptive and historical account*. Edinburgh.

Johnson, M. and K. Campbell (2010) 'Elements of an eighteenth century landscape revealed: Excavations within the former gardens of Caroline Park House, Edinburgh' in *Garden History*, Volume 38, No. 1. pp.81-98.

MacGibbon, D. and Ross, T (1887) *The Castellated and Domestic Architecture of Scotland*. Volume II. Edinburgh: David Douglas. pp. 455 and 462.

Online sources

Granton History. Caroline Park at http://www.grantonhistory.org/buildings/caroline_park.htm [accessed 22/07/2016].

* This assessment is based on our current state of knowledge and has been prepared for the purpose of consultation or to provide a view on the special interest of a building. This assessment is a consultation document and will form the basis of any new or updated listed building record should the structure be listed. The content of this assessment may change to take into account further information received as a result of the consultation process.

** A building may be found to meet the listing criteria but in some circumstances may not be added to the list. See 'When might Historic Environment Scotland list a building' at <https://www.historicenvironment.scot/advice-and-support/listing-scheduling-and-designations/listed-buildings/what-is-listing/>