



## Case information

---

<b>Reference/Case ID</b>	201601316		
<b>Scheduled Monument</b>	Seton Collegiate Church		
<b>Index no</b>	M13368	<b>Grid Ref</b>	NT418750 341800.0000 675100.0000
<b>Date of Application</b>	11 May 2016	<b>Application Received</b>	09 June 2016
<b>Summary of proposed works</b>	New inscription added in situ to the Stevenson Memorial, on the floor of the chancel.		

## 1. Summary recommendation

---

This report recommends that approval for the addition of a new inscription to the existing floor memorial of Seton Collegiate Church chancel be granted without conditions.

## 2. Background

---

The monument is the remains of Seton Collegiate Church, constructed mainly in the second half of the 15th century and the early 16th century on the site of an earlier church. It survives as a roofed building comprising an apsidal choir, sacristy, and transepts with crossing tower; the surrounding footings of the domestic accommodation for the college of priests; a collection of carved stones; and the boundary walls.

Seton Collegiate Church is cruciform on plan and the upstanding remains survive in excellent condition. The church displays many outstanding architectural features and fine carved stonework. Of particular note in the choir are the elaborate stone piscina and a 15th-century monumental tomb with recumbent stone effigies of a man and woman.

The Stevenson family hold right of burial at the monument, which is cared for by HES Conservation Directorate and is open to the public. The applicant and client met on site with Ronald Archibald and Deirdre Cameron of HES to discuss the proposed works, on 22 April 2016. The applicant has provided a method statement for the proposed works.

### 3. Proposals

---

Consented works – the addition of a new inscription to the existing floor memorial of Seton Collegiate Church chancel.

The proposals comprise:

- Tracing of the inscription (names and dates) using pencil and carbon paper on to the stone
- Hand carving of the inscription in situ, using a sharp tungsten tipped chisel and small iron dolly; a method statement includes careful preparation of the area mitigating damage to and disturbance of the monument during the process of stone carving.

### 4. Representations received

---

No representations were received.

### 5. Report

---

#### a) Policy considerations

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

#### Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

Part 1 Section 2 (3) – authorises works where Scottish Ministers or Historic Environment Scotland Have granted consent (scheduled monument consent) for the execution of the works where the works are executed in accordance with the terms of the consent and of any conditions attached to the consent.

#### Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016 (the policy statement)

3.4. Scheduled monument consent is required for any works that would demolish, destroy, damage, remove, repair, alter or add to the monument or to carry out any flooding or tipping on the monument. It is a criminal offence to carry out any of these works without consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument. (Annex 1 sets out guidance as to how cultural significance and national importance should be determined).

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

3.19. Extensive intervention will only be allowed where it is clearly necessary to secure the longer-term preservation of the monument, or where it will clearly generate public benefits of national importance which outweigh the impact on the national cultural significance of the monument. Such public benefits could come from, for example, interventions which make public access to scheduled monuments easier, or assist public understanding, or will produce economic benefits once the works are completed.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

3.22. Where consent for the range of works set out in paragraph 3.4 is granted, conditions are normally applied to ensure the works are undertaken in an appropriate manner. Common requirements are:

- a. the use of appropriate assessment methodologies to determine the full impact of any proposed management, use or development;
- d. that the management and execution of alteration, including remedial work, is sympathetic to the historic character;
- e. that appropriate skills and techniques, materials and construction techniques are specified where appropriate;
- f. that an appropriate level of record is made before, during and after any work and deposited in local and national archives, and, where appropriate, published;
- g. that it is possible, on close inspection, to differentiate new work from old particularly on masonry structures;
- i. that the design, planning and execution of works on scheduled monuments are undertaken by people with appropriate professional and craft qualifications, skills and experience.

## **b) Assessment**

The works involve the carving of a new inscription, added in situ, to the Stevenson Memorial on the floor of the chancel.

The physical impact of the works will be minor as the chancel floor has an existing memorial inscription, carved into the limestone and likely added in the 1950s. The new inscription will be designed and carved to match the existing memorials' script.

The works to include a new carving will not impact on the significance of the existing fabric, as the existing limestone floor slab is a relatively new addition. The chancel

and memorial form part of the cultural significance of the monument as a place of burial and worship for the Stevenson family, and therefore the works can be considered the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving that cultural significance.

The applicant has provided a detailed and sensitive method statement mitigating any impact on the surrounding fabric and disturbance to the monument. Given this approach to works, the application is considered compliant with paragraph 3.20 of the policy statement

**c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places**

No impact on Protected Species and Places considered likely – see PP&S assessment.

**d) Conclusion**

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The application, comprising the addition of a new memorial inscription into the limestone floor of the chancel are minor and do not detract from the significance of the monument, with minor impact on the fabric. The application is therefore compliant with paragraphs 3.16 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

The application meets paragraph 3.20 which demonstrates that the works are carefully considered, sensitively designed and properly planned. This enables paragraph 3.22 of the policy statement to be met without the need for any conditions.

## **6. Recommended decision**

---

The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted without conditions**.

### **Conditions**

---

None.

## 8. Approval

---

<b>Officer</b>	<b>Hazel Johnson</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>27/07/2016</b>
<b>Approved by</b>	<b>George Findlater</b>	<b>Date</b>	<b>28/07/2016</b>

### Annex A – list of supporting documents

- Site Plan Location
- Site Plan Detail
- Method Statement
- Copy of Notification
- Text for Inscription