

Case information

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Case ID | 300017411 |
| File Reference | HGH/B/GA/81 |
| Name of Site | West Lodge, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen |

| | | | |
|---------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------------|---|
| Local Authority | Aberdeen City Council | | |
| National Grid Reference | NJ 91038 03186 | | |
| Designation No. (if any) | LB52365 | | |
| Designation Type | Listed Building | Current Category of Listing | B |
| Case Type | Amendment | | |

| | |
|----------------------------|------------|
| Received/Start Date | 04/02/2014 |
| Decision Date | 06/05/2016 |

1. Decision

In our current state of knowledge, West Lodge continues to meet the criteria for listing. The building which was previously included in the B-listed Garthdee House (LB47908) has been listed separately at category C.

| | |
|-----------------------------------|--|
| Previous Statutory Address | Garthdee Road, Garthdee House (Scott Sutherland School of Architecture), including Terrace Walls and Steps, East and West Lodges |
| Amended Statutory Address | West Lodge including gatepiers and rear outbuilding and excluding former ancillary building to west, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen |

2. Designation Background and Development Proposals

2.1 Designation Background

Garthdee House, with the East and West Lodges, was listed at category B on 30/042001. The building is located within Pitfodels Conservation Area.

2.2 Development Proposals

There are no known development proposals.

3. Assessment

3.1 Assessment information

West Lodge was considered for amendment as part of the Pitfodels Conservation Area Listing Review 2014-16. The building was visited on 04/12/2014, and the interior and exterior were seen at this visit.

3.2 Assessment against designation criteria

The building was found to meet the criteria for listing.

An assessment against the Listing criteria was carried out, see **Annex A**.

The designation criteria are found in the Scottish Historic Environment Policy (SHEP), pp. 71-85. <http://www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/shep-dec2011.pdf>

Elizabeth McCrone

Head of Designations
Heritage Management
Historic Environment Scotland

| | |
|----------------|--|
| Contact | Rosanne Watts, Senior Designations Officer rosanne.watts@hes.scot , 0131 668 8091 |
|----------------|--|

ANNEX A – Assessment Against the Listing Criteria*

West Lodge including gatepiers and rear outbuilding and excluding former ancillary building to west, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen

1. Description

West Lodge was built in 1872 and is a single storey and attic, 3 bay, rectangular-plan, former gate lodge to the northwest of Garthdee House. In accordance with Section 1 (4A) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 the following are excluded from the listing: former L-plan ancillary range to the west of the lodge.

West Lodge is constructed in Aberdeen bond, cherry-cocked granite with a base course, tooled granite, long and short margins and the openings are chamfered. It has kneelered gables and skewputts. At the centre of the principal (southeast) elevation is a slightly advanced kneelered entrance gable with a pointed arched doorpiece and a replacement entrance door. Above the doorpiece is a spherical light suspended on a decorative iron bracket over the door, and there is a blind shield to the gablehead and stone finial at the apex. Box dormers flank the central gable. The northeast gable elevation has a 3-light canted bay window in ashlar granite, with a cornice and blocking course. The rear (northwest) elevation has a 20th century, single storey addition which is harled and has a piended roof. There is a box dormer to the northwest roof pitch of the lodge.

To the rear of the lodge is a single storey, rectangular plan, rubble-built outbuilding, with a monopitch slate roof.

There is predominantly 4-pane glazing in timber sash and case frames. The roof is pitched with grey slates. There are gablehead stacks with chamfered copes and pairs of decorative clay cans.

The interior, seen in 2014, is symmetrically arranged around a central staircase. No features from the 19th century decorative scheme are apparent.

To the north and northeast are two pairs of squat, square-plan gatepiers, with stop-chamfered corners, moulded cornice detail and very shallow pyramidal cap.

2. Assessment Against the Listing Criteria (SHEP, 2011) pp74-75

Criteria for determining whether a building is of 'special architectural or historic interest' for listing under the terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 [www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1997/9/contents]

To be listed, a building need not meet all the listing criteria. The criteria provide a framework within which judgement is exercised in reaching individual decisions.

2.1 Age and Rarity

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

West Lodge was built as one of a pair of gate lodges for Garthdee House (listed at category B) and is located around 0.3 km to the northwest of the house (and about 0.4km to the west of East Lodge). Garthdee House and its associated lodges are first shown on the 2nd edition Ordnance Survey Map of 1901. On this map West Lodge is shown as rectangular in plan, with a canted bay to the northeast elevation and the outbuilding immediately to the rear.

Gate lodges are not a rare building type in an estate context in Scotland, and there are many surviving 19th century examples. Lodges were typically built adjacent to paired gatepiers to mark entrances to estates, as can be seen here at Garthdee. The lodges were usually designed by the architects of the main house, and often stylistically similar. The historical relationship of the lodge and Garthdee House is evident from the external stonework detailing of the lodge, which references the Jacobean detailing of Garthdee House. It is therefore likely that West Lodge and East Lodge were designed by William Smith II and are contemporary with Garthdee House, which was built in 1872.

To the west of lodge is a single storey, L-plan, rubble-built ancillary building. This has been altered for use as offices and has substantial extensions to the south and west. It is not considered to be of special interest in listing terms.

In 1953 Thomas Scott Sutherland (1899–1963) bought the 20 acre Garthdee estate and lived in Garthdee House. Scott Sutherland was an Aberdeen School of Architecture graduate, who became an architect and entrepreneur and gifted the estate to Robert Gordon's College in 1953 for the building to be used as the college's School of Architecture. This gift estate was decisive in the history of Robert Gordon University. The relocation of Gray's School of Art to Garthdee in 1967 marked the beginning of the development of the campus, and since then further land has been purchased and the campus is now the centre of the University as all other departments have relocated here. West Lodge accommodated the University's gardener and East Lodge accommodated the Janitor. Both lodges are now used as teaching spaces or office spaces. The origins of Robert Gordon University can be traced back to 1729 when Robert Gordon, an Aberdeen merchant trader, founded Robert Gordon's Hospital to educate the young sons and grandsons of the Burgesses of the Guild who were too poor to send them to school. In 1881 the hospital became Robert Gordon's College with a secondary day school and separate adult education college. Since 1881 the training work of various other institutes and societies were transferred to the college, leading to various name changes until it was awarded university status in 1992.

Garthdee Estate is situated in the Pitfodels area of Aberdeen. The rural Pitfodels estate, which stretched from Cults to the Bridge of Dee, was owned by the Menzies family since the 15th century. From 1805 the last laird, John Menzies began to feu some of the estate and when he died in 1843, without any descendants the remaining estate was purchased by the Pitfodels Land Company. Brogden, in his book *Aberdeen, An Illustrated Architectural Guide* (1998), notes that the plots varied in size, but were as large as 8-10 acres along the side of the River Dee, where Garthdee is situated. An 1895 account describes it as follows "...The greater part of the lands of Pitfodels is now studded with beautiful mansions and villas, each of which stands amid well laid out and carefully kept grounds. They mostly belong to

manufacturers and gentlemen engaged in business in Aberdeen, and retired gentlemen." (Mackintosh, p.29). Large villas surrounded by trees were erected in a number of the larger plots and these continue to be a feature of this area.

As noted above gate lodges of this date are not a rare building type in an estate context. West Lodge is an important former ancillary component of the Garthdee estate, and forms a good group with the associated listed buildings of Garthdee House and East Lodge. The Jacobean detailing of the lodge signifies this relationship.

2.2 Architectural or Historic Interest

Interior

No features from the 19th century decorative scheme are apparent and there is no special interest in listing terms.

Plan form

The largely symmetrical plan form, with principal rooms flanking a central staircase, is typical for gate lodges buildings of this date. The footprint of the building has been extended to the rear, however gate lodges of this date have frequently been extended to increase living accommodation. There is no special interest in listing terms.

Technological excellence or innovation, material or design quality

The lodge has some Jacobean architectural detailing, such as kneelered gables with stone finial and a canted window. While such detailing is not uncommon for gate lodges from the early 19th century the detailing evident at West Lodge is similar to the East Lodge and Garthdee House, and is indicative of the former functional relationship of these buildings.

William Smith II (1817-1891) was a prolific Aberdeen based architect. In 1845 he became a partner in his father's firm, and his major commission was Trinity Hall on Union Street, Aberdeen, in 1846 (listed at B). The practice's work was wide ranging with public buildings and private houses, most notably Balmoral Castle in 1852 (listed at category A) for Prince Albert, consort to Queen Victoria. Many of practice's houses are designed in the Scots Tudor-Jacobean idiom which John Smith had developed from his association with William Burn's schemes for Robert Gordon's College in Aberdeen, Fintray House and Auchmacoy. Brodgen notes that the composition and Jacobean detailing of Garthdee House is derived from Burn's design for Auchmacoy House in Logie-Buchan Parish (listed at category B).

Setting

West Lodge is prominently sited adjacent to Garthdee Road and remains adjacent to one of the principal access roads to the Garthdee estate, which has been redeveloped into a university campus. Whilst the setting of the lodge has changed since it was built in the late 19th century, the lodge retains its gatepiers, which is of interest as an indication of the building's historical function and its relationship with Garthdee House is still discernible.

Regional variations

The lodge is constructed in Aberdeen bond, cherry-cocked granite. Cherry caulking, where small stones are inserted into the mortared joints, is strongly associated with the northeast of Scotland and therefore is of interest here as the bonding technique is particular to Aberdeen.

2.3 Close Historical Associations

None known at present.

3. Working with the Principles of Listing (SHEP 2011, p76)

In choosing buildings within the above broad headings particular attention is paid to:

- a. special value within building types*
- b. contribution to an architecturally or historically interesting group*
- c. the impact of vernacular buildings*
- d. authenticity*

When working with the principles of listing East Lodge has particular interest under b.

b. It is an important former ancillary component of Garthdee estate, and the detailing of the lodge signifies this relationship.

4. Summary of Assessment Against the Listing Criteria**

To the northeast of Garthdee House, this gate lodge with associated gatepiers is an important ancillary component of the estate and enhances the architectural and historic setting of Garthdee House. The lodge has some good Jacobean stonework details, such as kneelered gables with a stone finial, which reference the style of Garthdee House. Together with Garthdee House and West Lodge, East Lodge is part of a group of estate buildings whose survival informs our understanding of this late 19th century estate which has been redeveloped into a university campus. In our current state of knowledge it continues to meet the criteria for listing.

In accordance with Section 1 (4A) of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 the following are excluded from the listing: former L-plan ancillary building to the west of the lodge.

5. Category of Listing

Categories of listing are non-statutory and buildings are assigned a category (A, B or C) according to their relative importance following the assessment against the criteria for listing.

Category definitions are found at: www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/heritage/historicandlistedbuildings/listing

When compared with other listed late 19th gate lodges, the architectural detailing of West Lodge is not as highly detailed for it to be considered a building of regional importance in listing terms, and the building has been altered. Category C denotes

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925

Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

buildings of local importance, lesser examples of any period, style or building type as originally constructed or moderately altered. The architectural and historic interest of West Lodge is considered to be of local importance, therefore category C is considered the most appropriate.

6. Other Information

N/A

7. References

Canmore: <http://canmore.org.uk/> CANMORE ID 149554.

Maps

Ordnance Survey (surveyed 1899, published 1901) Kincardineshire 007.02 (includes: Aberdeen; Banchory-Devenick; Nigg; Peterculter). 2nd Edition. 25 inches to 1 mile. Southampton: Ordnance Survey.

Online Sources

Dictionary of Scottish Architects. *Garthdee House* at http://www.scottisharchitects.org.uk/building_full.php?id=213217 (accessed 17/04/2015).

Mackintosh, J. (1895) *History of the valley of the Dee, from the earliest times to the present day* at http://www.archive.org/stream/historyvalleyde00mackgoog/historyvalleyde00mackgoog_djvu.txt (accessed 17/04/2015).

* This assessment is based on our current state of knowledge and has been prepared for the purpose of consultation or to provide a view on the special interest of a building. This assessment is a consultation document and will form the basis of any new or updated listed building record should the structure be listed. The content of this assessment may change to take into account further information received as a result of the consultation process.

** A building may be found to meet the listing criteria but in some circumstances may not be added to the list. See 'When might Historic Scotland list a building' at www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/historicandlistedbuildings/whatwelist