

Case information

Case ID	300017412		
File Reference	HGH/B/GA/81		
Name of Site	East Lodge, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen		
Local Authority	Aberdeen City Council		
National Grid Reference	NJ 91430 03120		
Designation No. (if any)	LB52364		
Designation Type	Listed Building	Current Category of Listing	B
Case Type	Amendment		
Received/Start Date	04/02/2014		
Decision Date	06/05/2016		

1. Decision

In our current state of knowledge, East Lodge continues to meet the criteria for listing. The building has been listed separately from Garthdee House (LB47908). The statutory listing address and the listed building record has been amended. The category of listing has changed from B to C.

Previous Statutory Address	Garthdee Road, Garthdee House (Scott Sutherland School of Architecture), including Terrace Walls and Steps, East and West Lodges
Amended Statutory Address	East Lodge including gatepiers, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen

2. Designation Background and Development Proposals

2.1 Designation Background

Garthdee House, with the East and West Lodges, was listed at category B on 30/04/2001. The building is located within Pitfodels Conservation Area.

2.2 Development Proposals

There are no known development proposals.

3. Assessment

3.1 Assessment information

East Lodge was considered for amendment as part of the Pitfodells Conservation Area Listing Review 2014-16. The building was visited on 04/12/2014, and the interior and exterior were seen at this visit.

3.2 Assessment against designation criteria

The building was found to meet the criteria for listing.

An assessment against the Listing criteria was carried out, see **Annex A**.

The designation criteria are found in the Scottish Historic Environment Policy (SHEP), pp. 71-85. <http://www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/shep-dec2011.pdf>

Elizabeth McCrone

Head of Designations
Heritage Management
Historic Environment Scotland

Contact	Rosanne Watts, Senior Designations Officer rosanne.watts@hes.scot , 0131 668 8091
----------------	--

ANNEX A – Assessment Against the Listing Criteria*

East Lodge including gatepiers, Robert Gordon University, Garthdee Road, Aberdeen

1. Description

East Lodge was built in 1872 and is a single storey and attic, 3 bay, rectangular-plan, Jacobean style former gate lodge to the northeast of Garthdee House. It is constructed in Aberdeen bond, cherry-cocked granite with a base course, tooled granite long and short margins and the openings are chamfered. It has kneelered gables and skewputts. At the centre of the principal (northwest) elevation is a slightly advanced kneelered entrance gable with a Tudor-arched doorpiece and a replacement entrance door. Above this doorpiece is a spherical light suspended on a decorative iron bracket, and there is a blind shield to the gablehead and stone finial at the apex. The southwest gable elevation has a 3-light canted bay window in ashlar granite with a cornice and blocking course. The rear (southeast) elevation has several additions of varying 20th century dates, and a box dormer flanked by two stacks.

There is predominantly 4-pane glazing in timber sash and case frames. The roof is pitched with grey slates. There are gablehead stacks with chamfered copes.

The interior, seen in 2014, is symmetrically arranged around a central staircase. There is painted timber boarding to dado in most rooms and plain corning.

To the north is a pair of squat, square-plan gatepiers, with stop-chamfered corners, moulded cornice detail and very shallow pyramidal cap.

2. Assessment Against the Listing Criteria (SHEP, 2011) pp74-75

Criteria for determining whether a building is of ‘special architectural or historic interest’ for listing under the terms of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) (Scotland) Act 1997 [www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/1997/9/contents]

To be listed, a building need not meet all the listing criteria. The criteria provide a framework within which judgement is exercised in reaching individual decisions.

2.1 Age and Rarity

East Lodge was built as one of a pair of gate lodges for Garthdee House (listed at category B) and is located just over 100m to the northeast of the house (and about 0.4km to the east of West Lodge). Garthdee House and its associated lodges are first shown on the 2nd edition Ordnance Survey Map of 1901. On this map East Lodge is shown as rectangular in plan, with a canted bay to the southwest elevation.

Gate lodges are not a rare building type in an estate context in Scotland, and there are many surviving 19th century examples. Lodges were typically built adjacent to paired gatepiers to mark entrances to estates, as can be seen here at Garthdee. The

lodges were usually designed by the architects of the main house, and often stylistically similar. The historical relationship of the lodge and Garthdee House is evident from the external stonework detailing of the lodge, which references the Jacobean detailing of Garthdee House. It is therefore likely that West and East Lodge were designed by William Smith II and are contemporary with Garthdee House, which was built in 1872.

In 1953 Thomas Scott Sutherland (1899–1963) bought the 20 acre Garthdee estate and lived in Garthdee House. Scott Sutherland was an Aberdeen School of Architecture graduate, who became an architect and entrepreneur and gifted the estate to Robert Gordon's College in 1953 for the building to be used as the college's School of Architecture. This gift estate was decisive in the history of Robert Gordon University. The relocation of Gray's School of Art to Garthdee in 1967 marked the beginning of the development of the campus, and since then further land has been purchased and the campus is now the centre of the University as all other departments have relocated here. West Lodge accommodated the University's gardener and East Lodge accommodated the Janitor. Both lodges are now used as teaching spaces or office spaces. The origins of Robert Gordon University can be traced back to 1729 when Robert Gordon, an Aberdeen merchant trader, founded Robert Gordon's Hospital to educate the young sons and grandsons of the Burgesses of the Guild who were too poor to send them to school. In 1881 the hospital became Robert Gordon's College with a secondary day school and separate adult education college. Since 1881 the training work of various other institutes and societies were transferred to the college, leading to various name changes until it was awarded university status in 1992.

Garthdee Estate is situated in the Pitfodels area of Aberdeen. The rural Pitfodels estate, which stretched from Cults to the Bridge of Dee, was owned by the Menzies family since the 15th century. From 1805 the last laird, John Menzies began to feu some of the estate and when he died in 1843, without any descendants the remaining estate was purchased by the Pitfodels Land Company. Brogden, in his book 'Aberdeen, An Illustrated Architectural Guide' (1998), notes that the plots varied in size, but were as large as 8-10 acres along the side of the River Dee, where Garthdee is situated. An 1895 account describes it as follows "...The greater part of the lands of Pitfodels is now studded with beautiful mansions and villas, each of which stands amid well laid out and carefully kept grounds. They mostly belong to manufacturers and gentlemen engaged in business in Aberdeen, and retired gentlemen." (Mackintosh, p.29). Large villas surrounded by trees were erected in a number of the larger plots and these continue to be a feature of this area.

As noted above gate lodges of this date are not a rare building type in an estate context. East Lodge is an important former ancillary component of the Garthdee estate, and forms a good group with its associated listed buildings of Garthdee House and West Lodge. The Jacobean detailing of the lodge signifies this relationship.

2.2 Architectural or Historic Interest

Interior

The interior detailing is typical for a building of this date and type and there is no special interest in listing terms.

Plan form

The largely symmetrical plan for, with principal rooms flanking a central staircase is typical for gate lodges buildings of this date. The footprint of the building has been extended to the rear, however gate lodges of this date have frequently been extended to increase living accommodation. There is no special interest in listing terms.

Technological excellence or innovation, material or design quality

The building is largely unaltered to its principal elevation, including an intact roofline and traditional glazing. The lodge has some Jacobean architectural detailing, such as kneelered gables with stone finial and a canted window. While such detailing is not uncommon for gate lodges from the early 19th century the detailing evident at East Lodge is similar to the West Lodge and Garthdee House, and is indicative of the former functional relationship of these buildings.

William Smith II (1817-1891) was a prolific Aberdeen based architect. In 1845 he became a partner in his father's firm, and his major commission was Trinity Hall on Union Street, Aberdeen, in 1846 (listed at B). The practice's work was wide ranging with public buildings and private houses, most notably Balmoral Castle in 1852 (listed at category A) for Prince Albert, consort to Queen Victoria. Many of practice's houses are designed in the Scots Tudor-Jacobean idiom which John Smith had developed from his association with William Burn's schemes for Robert Gordon's College in Aberdeen, Fintray House and Auchmacoy. Brodgen notes that the composition and Jacobean detailing of Garthdee House is derived from Burn's design for Auchmacoy House in Logie-Buchan Parish (listed at category B).

Setting

East Lodge is prominently sited adjacent to Garthdee Road and remains adjacent to one of the principal access roads to the Garthdee estate, which has been redeveloped into a university campus. Whilst the setting of the lodge has changed since it was built in the late 19th century, the lodge remains intervisible with Garthdee House, and retains its associated gatepiers, which is of interest as an indication of the building's historical function.

Regional variations

The lodge is constructed in Aberdeen bond, cherry-cocked granite. Cherry caulking, where small stones are inserted into the mortared joints, is strongly associated with the northeast of Scotland and therefore is of interest here as the bonding technique is particular to Aberdeen.

2.3 Close Historical Associations

None known at present.

3. Working with the Principles of Listing (SHEP 2011, p76)

In choosing buildings within the above broad headings particular attention is paid to:

- a. special value within building types*
- b. contribution to an architecturally or historically interesting group*
- c. the impact of vernacular buildings*
- d. authenticity*

When working with the principles of listing East Lodge has particular interest under b.

b. It is an important former ancillary component of Garthdee estate, and the Jacobean detailing of the lodge signifies this relationship.

4. Summary of Assessment Against the Listing Criteria**

To the northwest of Garthdee House, this former gate lodge with associated gatepiers is an important ancillary component of the estate and enhances the architectural and historic setting of Garthdee House. The lodge is largely unaltered to its principal elevation and has some good Jacobean stonework details, such as kneelered gables with a stone finial, which reference the style of Garthdee House. Together with Garthdee House and West Lodge, East Lodge is part of a group of estate buildings whose survival informs our understanding of this late 19th century estate which has been redeveloped into a university campus in the 20th century. In our current state of knowledge it continues to meet the criteria for listing.

5. Category of Listing

Categories of listing are non-statutory and buildings are assigned a category (A, B or C) according to their relative importance following the assessment against the criteria for listing.

Category definitions are found at: www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/heritage/historicandlistedbuildings/listing

When compared with other listed late 19th gate lodges, the architectural detailing of East Lodge is not as highly detailed for it to be considered a building of regional importance in listing terms, and the building has been altered. Category C denotes buildings of local importance, lesser examples of any period, style or building type as originally constructed or moderately altered. The architectural and historic interest of East Lodge is considered to be of local importance, therefore category C is considered the most appropriate.

6. Other Information

N/A

7. References

Canmore: <http://canmore.org.uk/> CANMORE ID 149554.

Maps

Ordnance Survey (surveyed 1899, published 1901) Kincardineshire 007.02 (includes: Aberdeen; Banchory-Devenick; Nigg; Peterculter). 2nd Edition. 25 inches to 1 mile. Southampton: Ordnance Survey.

Online Sources

Dictionary of Scottish Architects. *Garthdee House* at http://www.scottisharchitects.org.uk/building_full.php?id=213217 (accessed 17/04/2015).

Mackintosh, J. (1895) *History of the valley of the Dee, from the earliest times to the present day* at http://www.archive.org/stream/historyvalleyde00mackgoog/historyvalleyde00mackgoog_djvu.txt (accessed 17/04/2015).

* This assessment is based on our current state of knowledge and has been prepared for the purpose of consultation or to provide a view on the special interest of a building. This assessment is a consultation document and will form the basis of any new or updated listed building record should the structure be listed. The content of this assessment may change to take into account further information received as a result of the consultation process.

** A building may be found to meet the listing criteria but in some circumstances may not be added to the list. See 'When might Historic Environment Scotland list a building' at www.historic-scotland.gov.uk/historicandlistedbuildings/whatwelist