Case information

Reference/Case ID	201506633

Scheduled Monument	Kilpatrick, dun, enclosure, hut circles, cairn and field system 1km S of		
Index no	M90186	**Grid Ref**	NR904261 190400.0000 626100.0000

Date of Application	19 January 2016	**Application Received**	19 January 2016
Summary of proposed works	Harvesting of conifers		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends approval without conditions.

2. Background

The monument comprises a prehistoric dun (fort) and later enclosure. In the surrounding area are several hut- circles with an associated field system, a kerb cairn and another funerary cairn. Early excavations in the dun recorded a Bronze Age burial beneath it.

There was a modern series of excavations within the currently scheduled area in the 1970s (Barber, J 1997 'The archaeological investigation of a prehistoric landscape: excavations on Arran 1978-1981'). These recorded funerary and settlement evidence dating to the Bronze Age as well as evidence for earlier Neolithic activity. Remains likely to date to medieval or post-medieval land-use have also been recorded.

The scheduled area measures up to 490m from E to W and 400m transversely. It mainly comprises open ground but the edge of a surrounding conifer plantation extends into it by up to approximately 25m in two locations on the east side. It is within these two areas that harvesting is proposed. Upstanding remains are not depicted within the two affected areas on a plan showing archaeological features contained in Barber 1997 (Figure 15).

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

It is proposed to harvest the conifers within the scheduled area. The method has been discussed during consultation with HES and a supplementary Method Statement provided. The area will not be replanted.

3. Proposals

The boundary of the monument would be marked with tape and shown on a site map. There would be no machine access in unplanted ground within the monument and this would also be marked on the site map.

The areas of harvesting within the monument would be visually inspected for upstanding features by Forestry Commission Scotland (FCS) staff. Any such features would be marked out and recorded in the Forester GIS Heritage Module geodatabase.

Within the scheduled area the harvester and forwarder would travel on a brash mat. The brash mat would avoid soft and wet ground to minimise ground disturbance. Timber would be stacked to the side of the mat by the harvester and extracted by the forwarder. Machines would not travel on any bare ground or where there is no brash mat.

After timber extraction the forwarder would extract as much of the brash mat as possible and place it not less than 10m from the monument boundary. During this operation the machine may need to travel off the brash mat but this would be done where there is no risk of causing extensive ground disturbance.

Fuel and oils would not be brought into the scheduled area and would be kept at least 20m from the boundary.

The Method Statement accompanying the application would form part of a pre-commencement briefing and would be discussed and given to machine operators. The operators would be given the site map referred to above and would be shown the SM boundary with FCS staff.

HES would be informed by FCS two weeks in advance of the start of site works.

4. Representations received

No representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments & Archaeologcial Areas Act 1979
- Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

The Scottish Historic Environment Policy

3.4. Scheduled monument consent is required for any works that would demolish, destroy, damage, remove, repair, alter or add to the monument or to carry out any flooding or tipping on the monument. It is a criminal offence to carry out any of these works without consent.

3.14. Scottish Ministers include a monument in the Schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of SHEP, that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.17. As each monument will require treatment specific to its individual nature, characteristics, significance and needs, any proposed change to it must be fully and explicitly justified.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

3.20. Where change is proposed, it should be carefully considered, based on good authority, sensitively designed, properly planned and executed, and where appropriate in the context of an individual monument, reversible.

b) Assessment

The proposals would remove conifers currently growing in the scheduled area. This would be done by machines working on brash mats and the machines would not work outside the planted area. The planted area in the scheduled monument would be visually inspected by FCS staff prior to the work and any upstanding features marked out; none such have been previously recorded. After harvesting timber and brash would be removed from the scheduled monument.

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

It is concluded that there should be no physical effect on areas of the monument outside the planted area. There should be minimal ground disturbance within the planted area. Following the works the currently planted parts of the monument would be cleared of mature conifers, brash and timber.

The works should have no adverse effect on the cultural significance of the monument. The harvesting of mature conifers from the edge of the monument would be beneficial as it would remove the risk of trees being blown over by wind, which can cause damage to archaeological features. It would also provide more open space around the upstanding features within the monument, which would be likely to improve the monument's setting and reduce the risk of self-seeded conifers growing within the monument.

The proposals have been designed to take into account the need to avoid damage to the cultural significance of the scheduled monument and appear to have been properly planned.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

The application site does not lie in a Site of Special Scientific Interest (SSSI), Special Area of Conservation (SAC) or Special Protection Area. National Biodiversity Network GIS data sets indicate no evidence for Protected Species in the relevant 100m grid squares.

d) Conclusion

It is concluded that the proposed work would conserve the cultural significance of the monument and so is consistent with SHEP 3.16 and 3.18.

There would be no replanting so removal of the trees in the scheduled area would enhance the long term preservation of the monument and hence the proposal accords with SHEP 3.14 and can be assessed as justified in accordance with SHEP 3.17.

The work has been carefully considered and properly planned in accord with SHEP 3.20.

6. Recommended decision

The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted** with no conditions.

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH

7. Approval

Officer	**Simon Stronach**	**Date**	**17/02/2016**
Approved by	**John Raven**	**Date**	**18/02/2016**

Annex A – list of supporting documents

Site Map: Kilpatrick Dun, Isle of Arran
Location Map: Kilpatrick Dun, Isle of Arran
Method Statement for Harvesting Trees on Kilpatrick Dun SAM

Historic Environment Scotland - Scottish Charity No. SC045925
Registered Address: Longmore House, Salisbury Place, Edinburgh, EH9 1SH