

Case information

Reference/Case ID	201505985		
Scheduled Monument	Edinburgh Castle		
Index no	M90130	Grid Ref	NT249734 324900.0000 673400.0000
Date of Application	11 December 2015	Application Received	17 December 2015
Summary of proposed works	Lifting and resetting of flagstones		

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that approval for lifting and resetting of existing flagstones within the Redcoat Café to facilitate adaption of existing services at Edinburgh Castle be granted without conditions.

2. Background

The monument comprises all the buildings and other structures, wells, fortifications, street furniture, historic plaques, roadways, yards, and other open spaces that form Edinburgh Castle. In this particular case, the element of the monument to be affected is the Redcoat Café, formerly a Cart Shed and Barracks building. The former Cart Shed/ Barracks underwent extensive renovations in the 1990s during their adaption to become a café.

There have been pre-application discussions between HES staff and the agents for Benugo, who run the cafe. That meeting confirmed that the works would require scheduled monument clearance. This application accords with the outcome of these discussions.

3. Proposals

Consented Works – Lifting and resetting of selected flagstones within the Redcoat Café

4. Representations received

Historic Environment Scotland, through their Internal Scheme of Delegation for Scottish Ministers, are content with the works.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be viewed with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

The Scottish Historic Environment Policy

3.14. Scottish Ministers include a monument in the Schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of SHEP, that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.

b) Assessment

The proposed works will involve the lifting and resetting of flagstones to assist in the adaption of services within the Redcoat Café. Three discrete areas are proposed to be lifted and reset, as can be seen on the applicants plan. The areas measure 0.8m x 0.75m, 0.75m x 2.1m and 0.75m x 1.5m respectively. The works are to facilitate access to, and to adapt where necessary existing services. I am informed by the District Architect for Edinburgh Castle that the flagstones have all been lifted and reset in the past.

The works form part of an overall re-design of the Redcoat Café and can be viewed as part of the re-design works. There will be no material change to the floor of the Redcoat Café as there are no replacement flagstones proposed. Given the location of the works and the function of the space I am content that there will be no impact upon the cultural significance of the monument.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

There are no other material considerations.

d) Conclusion

It is clear that this intervention should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAAA 1979 and under section 3.4 of SHEP. The works are in the form of an addition to the monument.

I am content that installation of a free standing pizza oven can therefore be considered as the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument, and thus compliant with SHEP 3.16 . The application contains sufficiently detailed information explaining both the reasoning behind the application and the methodology to be used to be considered to be consistent with SHEP 3.17, 3.20 and 3.22.

The proposed works will have no impact upon the cultural significance of Edinburgh Castle. The works are contained entirely within the Redcoat Café and will be viewed from that standpoint. The flagstones have been lifted and reset previously and so these works have precedent.

I am content that the application contains sufficiently detailed methodologies and justification that a consent may be granted without the requirement for conditions.

6. Recommended decision

The works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

I recommend consent is **granted without conditions.**

7. Conditions

None

8. Approval

Officer	Rory McDonald	Date	05/02/2016
Approved by	George Findlater	Date	05/02/2016

Annex A – list of supporting documents

1. Proposed Services [AL(43)01]
2. Proposed Service and Kitchen Area Plans [AL(80)00]
3. Existing Plan (GA) [AL(00)00]
4. Proposed Plan (GA) [AL(00)01]