



Case Information

Reference/Case ID	300018687
--------------------------	-----------

Scheduled Monument	Duffus Castle		
Index no	SM90105	Grid ref	NJ 18900 67200

Date application validated	08 November 2016
Summary of proposed works	Masonry survey and materials sampling & analysis

1. Summary recommendation

This report recommends that approval for masonry and mortar survey, sampling and analysis be granted with conditions.

2. Background

The monument comprises Duffus Castle. The castle was built around 1150 by Freskin, a Flemish soldier. The bailey is surrounded by the remains of a stone curtain wall and within this is a 15th century domestic range including a hall and cellars. This building replaced the abandoned tower and may itself have been greatly remodelled by the time Claverhouse dined here during the campaign that ended at Killiecrankie in 1689. Around the whole site is a boundary ditch, now filled with water.

The scheduled area includes the boundary ditch and all of the area within it. It is an irregular oval on plan and measures a maximum of 235m E-W by 240m N-S.

Duffus Castle is of national importance because it is a particularly fine example of a motte and bailey castle which remains intact. In addition it has one of the finest stone keeps in Scotland. It also has the potential to provide archaeological evidence of fortifications, domestic arrangements, material culture and architectural details from the 12th to the 17th centuries. The castle is a Property in Care.

It is the remaining upstanding walls of the West Keep, that this application relates to. The application is for masonry and mortar survey, sampling and analysis and has been submitted as part of a research project by the University of Stirling.



The application is accompanied by supporting documents and has been informed by a rapid preliminary survey. It is possible to complete the proposed survey from ground levels with use of a stepladder only to access primary mortar. Access to higher levels of masonry will be discussed with the HES Architect for the site. Masonry and mortar from the west keep, curtain wall and larger range have been assessed to have good research potential to inform our understanding of the development of the monument.

The proposed work forms part of the Scottish Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project and has been discussed with HES Casework Team in advance. This included email correspondence during the application regarding the proposed reporting arrangements. The application is supported by a report of the preliminary survey and a sampling strategy document. This application accords with the outcome of those discussions.

3. Proposals

- Collection of mortar samples from several contexts.
- Removal from site for lab-based analysis

Consented works – 2 – 4 small mortar samples, from an area measuring approximately 50 x 50 x 50mm to be extracted from the west keep and the curtain wall and 1 sample from the later range. 15 - 25 smaller samples (approximately 0.5g or 1 cm³) containing relict fuel will also be extracted from across the monument.

All samples will be from the surface of the monument, from core rubble contexts made visible by historic masonry collapse.

The samples will be removed using hand tools. No samples would be retrieved where the masonry is considered fragile or where sample removal is likely to accelerate the deterioration of the monument in any way.

The samples would be stored appropriately. They will be thin sectioned and examined using effective types of microscopy. Samples will be radiocarbon dated by the SUERC laboratory.

The site work is to be described in a short report, with a plan showing the sample contexts, to be supplied to HES within 4 weeks of the completion of site works. A full report would be submitted following completion of all analyses. Any variation to the reporting arrangements would be subject to agreement with HES.

Personnel – The work will be undertaken by a suitably experienced academic and a qualified stonemason licensed under HES' construction Site Certification Scheme from the University of Stirling, who has successfully undertaken similar work at other monuments.



4. Representations received

No third party representations were received.

5. Report

a) Policy considerations

The application should be considered with the following legislative and policy considerations in mind:

Ancient Monuments and Archaeological Areas Act 1979

Part 1 Section 2 - Control of works affecting an ancient monument.

Part 1 Section 2 (3) – authorises works where Scottish Ministers or Historic Environment Scotland have granted consent (scheduled monument consent) for the execution of the works where the works are executed in accordance with the terms of the consent and of any conditions attached to the consent.

Historic Environment Scotland Policy Statement June 2016

3.14. A monument is included in the schedule to secure the long-term legal protection of the monument in the national interest, in situ and as far as possible in the state it has come down to us. Scheduled monuments have an intrinsic value as monuments, not related to any concept of active use. It is the value of the monument to the nation's heritage, in terms set out in the section on Scheduling in Chapter 2 of this policy statement that is the primary consideration in determining applications for scheduled monument consent.

3.16. Works on scheduled monuments should therefore normally be the minimum level of intervention that is consistent with conserving what is culturally significant in a monument.

3.18. Scheduled monument consent applications must be considered in terms of the cultural significance of the monument and the impact that the proposals would have upon this cultural significance. The more important particular features of the monument are to its cultural significance, the greater will be the case against interventions which modify these features.



b) Assessment

The proposed works involve the retrieval and removal of small mortar samples from a number of locations at Duffus Castle. This work forms part of the Scottish Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project, which aims to improve our understanding of the development of these structures. The proposed work has the potential to significantly increase our understanding of this monument, and, more generally, the development of castles throughout Scotland.

The physical impact of the proposed works would be minor and it is proposed to remove a number of mortar samples from locations that have been identified during preliminary survey. The work would be undertaken by a suitably experienced archaeologist with a stonemasonry qualification. They would ensure that samples were retrieved from locations with the potential to increase our understanding of the monument whilst not adversely affecting the cultural significance of the monument. The removal of these samples would have no substantive physical impact on the monument and would not visually alter it. The cultural significance of the monument would be unaltered by the work.

Because the works would not affect the conservation or cultural significance of the monument they are consistent with paragraphs 3.14 and 3.18 of the policy statement.

The application is supported by the results of a preliminary survey and proposed strategy. Taken together these provide a strong justification and a carefully considered methodology for site works and subsequent analyses. The project team are highly experienced and have an established track record of successful delivery of similar projects; the work forms part of the Scottish Medieval Castles and Chapels C-14 Project

The application has been accompanied by a detailed Project Design that sets out a well-considered, appropriate and careful methodology. However, no provision for reporting has been added.

c) Other material considerations, including impact of the works on Protected Species and Places

No impact on Protected Species and Places considered likely – see PP&S assessment

d) Conclusion

The application should be viewed as works as set out in both Part 1 Section 2 of the AMAA Act 1979 and paragraph 3.4 of the policy statement.

The proposed works, comprising mortar sampling and analyses, would have no impact on the cultural significance of the monument and therefore do not conflict with 3.18 of the policy statement.



However, the application contains no provision for reporting, two conditions have therefore been added.

6. Recommended decision

Subject to compliance with the schedule of conditions, the works proposed are considered acceptable in meeting the terms of national policy for scheduled monuments, and also accounting for other material considerations.

It is recommended that consent is **granted subject to the conditions detailed below.**

7. Conditions

1. A short report detailing the location of the mortar samples shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland within three weeks of the works being completed on site.

Reason: to ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.

2. Within six months of the works being completed on site the final report on the results of the mortar analysis shall be submitted to Historic Environment Scotland

Reason: to ensure that an accurate record of works to the monument is maintained.

8. Approval

Case officer	Hazel Johnson	Date	20 December 2016
Approved by	John Raven	Date	20 December 2016

Annex A – list of supporting documents

- Preliminary Survey – Ref: SC14-DCM-PRE-01
- Sampling Strategy – Ref: SC14-DCM-PRE-02